

**CITY OF PHOENIX  
PARKS AND RECREATION BOARD  
SUMMARY MINUTES  
March 22, 2018**

**City Council Chambers, 200 W. Jefferson St., Phoenix, Arizona.**

**Board Members Present**

Masavi Perea  
Sarah Porter  
Dorina Bustamante  
Tony Moya

**Board Members Present**

**Via Teleconference**

Michael Lieb  
Charlene Tarver

**Board Member Absent**

Aubrey Barnwell

**Staff Present**

Inger Erickson  
Tracee Crockett  
Tim Merritt  
Gregg Bach  
Alonso Avitia  
Cynthia Brown  
Danielle Poveromo  
Tricia Quiroz  
Esther Avila  
Michael Smiley  
Natasha Hughes  
Joe Diaz  
Claire Miller  
Sallie Seibert  
Dianna Elias  
Andria Jackson  
Erin Delaney  
Mike Francis  
Nick Alejandro  
Jeanne Delaney  
Judy Weiss  
Nellie Ramon  
James Orloski  
Theresa Faull  
Ray Ficcaglia  
Kelly Patterson  
Anissa Edouard  
Cynthia Aguilar  
Patricia Boland  
Paul Mangan

**Others Present**

Michelle Beckett  
Layla Ressler  
Gregory Thorley  
Elizabeth Thorley

**Others Present**

Nadia Holguin  
Armando Hernandez  
Pat McCutchan  
Ethan Dougherty  
Barbara Halden  
Morgan Weiran  
Colton Tuttle  
Paul Waxman  
Becky McShurley  
Susan Alberts  
Joshua Duncan  
Alecia Duncan  
CJ Johnson  
Monica Castillo  
Alex Stevenson  
Kyle Rogers  
Lauren Saria  
Natalie Morris  
Jim Mathien  
Brian Stanley  
Molly Powell  
Kris Floor  
Colleen Lafferty  
Jamie Balesteri  
Mary Stock  
Zack Barna  
John Furniss  
Dan King  
Jackie Centrella  
Joshua Crawford  
Tracee McEluogue  
RB Schoeneman  
Erick Lundgren  
Abby Loza  
Bob Hubbard  
Mike Lindsey  
Cheryl Lindsey  
Robert Salinger

**Others Present**

Michael Lundgren  
Morgan Tucker  
Kathy Skeeley  
Armando Leon  
Jim Kasten  
Jeffrey Abbett  
Carly Gordon  
Mike Moore  
Gayatri Girirajan  
Jill Blewett  
Doug Robson  
Dwayne Allen  
Patrick Cunningham  
John Lochis  
Eric Vanacker  
Christian Larsen  
Keith Mahl  
Leatrice Kitchell  
Jon Kitchell  
Luis Solis  
Becca Rubens  
Lauren Bailey  
Jesse Rieser  
Cindy Moore  
Kathryn Tan  
John Tan  
Dennis Wright  
Denise Robson  
Derek Kuns  
Kylee Cunningham  
Judie Smith  
Guillermo Bracamonte  
Steven Preriatt  
William Barnes  
Alison Kincaid  
Juan Cuevas  
Sarah Chisholm  
Zach Walker  
Samantha Kahawai  
Andrea Prevatt  
Nate Gossage  
Ronald Allundar  
Ian Romero  
Matt Moore  
Mac McDonald

**Others Present**

Tim McCormac  
Nick Wood  
Noel Griesmann  
Stephanie Watney  
Douglas Righi  
Robert Ray  
Sally Boyle  
Jayne Forbes  
Robert Forbes  
Scott Havice  
Kirstin Havice  
Stephen Johnson  
Julie Horn  
Nikki Camarillo  
Zeus Miranda Felix  
Jennifer McCabe  
Melissa DiGianfilippo  
Julia Churgerman  
Casey Wallin  
Aaron Chamberlin  
Gennaro Garcia  
Chelsea Comfort  
Joe Miller  
Robert Stratton  
Austen Sherman  
Keith Horm  
Jennifer Caraway  
Maria Olsen  
Alex Leiphart  
Gilda Lima  
Alexia Nunez  
Kristin Shaoul  
Brenda Ortiz  
Ann Collery  
Heather Daniel  
Valerie Harris  
Richard Sinelmann  
Dan Vermillion  
David Friedman  
Ryan McLaughlin  
Ryan Ingram  
Tamara Stanger  
Alice Butler  
Melissa Ewers  
Bruce Hilby

**Others Present**

Sharon Willocks  
Donna Homsher  
Christina Powers  
Tom Haskin  
Tiffany Anderson  
Tom Waldeck  
Terri Nacke  
Jim Tucker  
Kevin Weir  
Anthony Ash  
Shawn Cunningham  
Kenneth O'Connor  
Chelsie Clauser  
Taylor Tiner  
Zane Silvernail  
Chris Sanders  
John Fische  
Sam Cooper  
Michael Finkelstein  
Suzanne Vilardi  
Michael Marlowe  
Taylor Nelson  
Elyse Guizzetti  
Carl Sepura  
Aaron Forbes  
Vishaka Johnson  
Kate Twist  
Cricket Alridge  
Julie Wilson  
Krista Peterson  
Patricia Suchart  
Richard Williams  
Tracy Rhodes  
Nina Moore  
Daniel Moore  
Lori Fenn  
Alva Montes  
Justin Hughes  
Jessica Phillips  
Cole Duffield  
Thamari Suchart  
Barbara Smith  
James Trahan  
Gage Mersener  
Carrie Marill

**Others Present**

Kate Rodorevic  
Connor Doscheemater  
Jacob Meders  
Jessica Hasty  
Justin Beckett  
Sylvia Wright  
Joseph Hobson  
Miguel Quiros  
Andrea Cooper  
Gregory Sale  
Eric Husor  
Tyson Sterling  
Jason Boblick  
Ken Clark  
Michele Saelor  
TJ Davis  
Tarek El Dokor  
Wende Katz  
Lalita Adkins  
Lori McClelland  
Travis Boltz  
Eric Gorseigner  
Butch Raphael  
Lisa Helsethfischl  
Alesix Krisay  
Jay Murphy  
Shelly Arnold  
Drew Peterson  
Melissa Sawhill  
Jordan Mueller  
E. Fropce  
Dan Mei  
Linda Jansen  
Tom Jansen  
Abby Pickenney  
Brett Dombrova  
Edward Martin  
Lee Purnell  
Alexandra Wallin  
Anna E Robinson  
Barbara Mei  
Brian Hughes  
Angie Caputa  
Paul Kolg  
Rocky Ellen

**Others Present**

Charles Ranson  
Brenda Brock  
Gary Stott  
Michael Widener  
Chris Taylor  
Damien Fausltwan  
Patty Emmert  
Melanie Lewis  
Jordan Dubin  
Sally Gettries  
Jennifer Anderson  
Eric Silvernail  
Joan Prior  
John A Armstrong  
Barbara Cummings  
Ivette Vargas  
Charles Johnson  
Hana Shafer  
Jilliann Feltham  
Richard Briemen  
Monica Milum  
Cynthia Trego  
Jay Trego  
Kathleen Coleman  
Ed Drummond  
Aric Mei  
Juli Burdette  
Amanda May  
Justin Novak  
Howie Lee  
Garrett Daniels  
Laura Rubert  
Jen Boblick  
Charleen Badman  
Jeremy Ellens  
Linda Ellens  
Carolyn Lavender  
Kayley Miller  
Chad Fackler  
Patrick Holcomb  
Aaron Bass  
Khamis Hammoudeh  
Katherine Hills  
Therron Brockish  
Darren Hill

**Others Present**

Joyce Moderow  
Ira Rubins  
Maya Dailey  
Judith Longmeyer  
Jim Loui  
Karen Loui  
James Mathien  
John Rosnek  
Rodger Loar  
Rick Engelmann  
Craig DeMarco  
John Cunningham  
Wendell Burnette  
Bernie Rivera  
Jonathon Vento  
Anna Enriquez  
Sasha Raj  
Patricia McCutchan  
Royce Davidson  
Eric Masty  
Caleb Iholhe  
Joel Contreras  
Gregory Sall  
Harold Ellens  
Taylor Carr  
Conrad Butler  
Ryan Kerr  
Valentina Fehr  
Rebecca McShirley  
Enrique France  
William Frederick  
Amanda Schultz  
Matt Cooley  
Olivia Laux  
John Locke  
Juel Leon  
Rebecca Rubens  
Allisan Colwell  
Isabelle Diep  
Alexis Krisan  
Siena Hayes  
Olivene Teel  
Mark Hayes  
Steven Prevatt  
Marcus McElhinney

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Called to order at 5:06 p.m.

**2. INFORMATION ONLY ITEM(S):**

**2a Phoenix Parks and Preserves Initiative Repayment**

Item not heard.

**2b. Camp Colley Update and 2018 Summer Season Outlook**

Item not heard

**2c. Eastlake Park Historic Preservation-Landmark Designation**

Item not heard

**2d. Phoenix Parks and Preserves Initiative Committee Overview Report**

Item not heard

**3. INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**3a. FitPHX Program Update**

Deputy Director Cynthia Aguilar introduced Anissa Edouard, FitPHX Coordinator, who presented the item. Ms. Edouard gave a presentation about recent FitPHX developments. She highlighted two innovative programs at Hance Park: WalkPHX Wednesdays and Fall into Fitness. WalkPHX Wednesdays, which is sponsored by Blue Cross Blue Shield, is a weekly free, social walk/run through downtown Phoenix, including three parks. The events occur on the second and fourth Wednesday of each month. The other event, Fall into Fitness, is a popular, free workout series, which is sponsored by AARP. Fall into Fitness takes place on Tuesday nights.

Ms. Edouard stated that WalkPHX infrastructure, which are mapped locations with arrows and mileage markers, have been added at 47 locations citywide. The WalkPHX paths, she said, are supplemented by instructor-led programs. There are 29 trail counters at WalkPHX paths, which help document the health benefits and give staff a big-picture look at usage of the paths.

Ms. Edouard also highlighted recent grants that FitPHX has applied for, including a National Park and Recreation Association (NRPA) grant and a Gila River Indian Community (GRIC) gaming grant. She stated that she is seeking additional sponsors and funding to expand fitness offerings and increase the overall health of the city.

Board Chair Porter stated that FitPHX is a great program.

### **3b. Five-Year Capital Improvement Program Update**

Deputy Director Judy Weiss introduced Joe Diaz, Principal Landscape Architect, who presented the item. Mr. Diaz highlighted the various types of parks and facilities, from traditional parks to pools, golf courses, specialty areas and mountain preserves. He showed a chart breaking down the funding since 2008 and the different fund sources, including the Phoenix Parks and Preserves Initiative (PPPI). Mr. Diaz also discussed the different types of projects that have been completed, including 71 playgrounds, 37 restrooms and 14 full park renovations. He stated that improvements have been made to 95 percent of parks; the remaining five percent are impact-fee-funded and aren't currently in need of improvements.

Mr. Diaz highlighted specific completed projects like Ma-Ha-Tuak Park, Willow Park, Nueve Park and the trailhead at Pima Canyon. He also discussed the process by which projects are identified, including community surveys, a community involvement process and finally Parks and Recreation Board (Board) approval. Mr. Diaz showed a map with all of the projects planned over the next five years and the types of improvements. He said that altogether, there is close to \$171 million in projects planned.

Board Member Lieb joined the meeting telephonically at 5:15 p.m.

Board Member Perea joined the meeting in person at 5:16 p.m.

Board Chair Porter clarified that two-thirds of funding comes from PPPI. She stated that this was a good opportunity to remind those in attendance that PPPI funds pay for park improvements and PPPI is an amazing plan for sustainable funding.

Board Member Moya asked about how the funds are allocated. He stated that he is interested in seeing an itemized statement with dollar amounts and individual budget items listed.

Director Inger Erickson stated that there are "pots" of money that staff looks to for funding if something fails. She listed lighting and ADA improvements as examples; the funds are not specifically identified for projects, but are available if something unexpected happens.

Board Member Perea asked a question about a map in the presentation. He wanted to clarify if the red dots indicated new construction.

Mr. Diaz replied that the dots are identified projects. Some are complete renovations and others are ramadas and/or playgrounds.

Director Erickson pointed out the operating cost that goes along with building new projects; due to the expense to operate new community centers, staff is currently

focused on improving and renovating existing park amenities. In regards to the mountain preserves, she said that most funding is going to South Mountain and Piestewa. South Mountain is nearing 100 years old and needs new infrastructure.

Board Member Perea asked about the community surveys and whether parking and drinking water are on the list of amenities.

Mr. Diaz confirmed those items are on the list.

Board Member Perea asked if any of the renovations include solar panels.

Mr. Diaz said that staff is exploring options for solar lighting. He stated that there are solar panels on top of the restrooms at Pima Canyon. He described that it can be challenging to get enough light and that the City has been focused on installing LED lighting.

Board Member Bustamante stated that she would like to see blacktops avoided in preserve areas in order to mitigate the heat island effect.

Mr. Diaz stated that they do so where there are opportunities, although it can sometimes be cost-prohibitive.

Board Chair Porter asked if the department has sustainability guidelines so that green projects are done whenever possible.

Mr. Diaz responded that the department does not have specific guidelines, but sustainability is one of their top priorities and they work with the Office of Environmental Programs to identify opportunities.

Board Member Bustamante stated that the Parks and Recreation Department should be leading the charge in creating sustainability demonstrations.

Mr. Diaz stated that staff will continue looking for opportunities.

#### **4. CONSENT ITEMS**

- 4a. Parks and Recreation Board Minutes**
- 4b. Request to Vend at Heritage Square Park**
- 4c. Approval Transfer of Telecommunications License at South Mountain Tower Site from (Hero Licenseco, LLC to HC2 Holdings, Inc., dba as HC2 Station Group, Inc.)**
- 4d. Approval Transfer of Telecommunications License at South Mountain Tower Site from (Azteca International Corporation to HC2 Network, Inc.)**

Board Member Bustamante motioned to approve items 4a through 4d; seconded by Board Member Moya.

Item approved 6:0.

#### **4e. Papago Baseball Complex**

Director Erickson showed a map orienting people to the location of the Papago Baseball Complex and listed some of the amenities on the property. She noted that, historically, the Oakland A's used the complex for spring training and had their games at Phoenix Muni. However, the A's relocated to Mesa and the City started renting the facility to other users. Director Erickson introduced Jeremy Legg, special projects administrator on loan from the Phoenix Convention Center.

Mr. Legg continued the presentation. He went over the basic terms of the deal. He stated that the City of Scottsdale and the San Francisco Giants would invest approximately \$35 million, over the term of 35 years, and take over the operations, maintenance and capital replacement costs associated with the facility. The improvements would require the temporary closure of the facility for about 14 months, with the complex reopening in early 2020. The proposed improvements include adding two more full-size fields, lighting improvements and upgrades to the clubhouse. Other improvements to the area include a new parking lot to be shared by baseball and softball users and an improved trail. Additionally, the Giants will host free baseball clinics and make use of the baseball complex available to the public on a limited basis. Mr. Legg showed a map of the improvements and trails included in the proposed renovations. He also displayed a table showing the status quo compared to the proposal and the financial impact. Mr. Legg noted that all of the fields and improvements revert back to the City of Phoenix at the end of the agreement.

Director Erickson concluded by saying that the City Council has authority over Intergovernmental Agreements (IGAs) and that the Board is being asked to make a recommendation to the City Council in support of the agreement.

Board Member Lieb explained how he coached baseball as his kids grew up and stated that the biggest issue with youth baseball in the county is field availability. In the long term, he said that the City of Phoenix gets fully-paid-for facilities and more availability for youth baseball.

Board Member Moya asked if the improvements will all be contained within the existing footprint.

Director Erickson responded that the proposal is extremely close to the existing footprint. She noted that it "bumps out" slightly, but does not affect any man-made trails.

Board Member Moya asked if everything would everything be closed during the 14 months of construction, or only the baseball fields.

Director Erickson confirmed that only the baseball fields would be closed.

Darren Hill stated that he is a PE teacher of 33 years and a baseball coach in east Phoenix. He has taken teams to tournaments at Papago. Mr. Hill said that he didn't know the facility existed until four years ago, but that the "cat is out of the bag" now and any City would want a venue like this, which is a point of pride for the City of Phoenix.

Therron Brockish stated that he has coached at the college and high school levels for 30 years and he is a professional scout and baseball writer. Mr. Brockish highlighted the economic impact of the facility. He stated that he has dealt with the Giants and the City of Scottsdale without success and said that there is little to no threat of the Giants leaving Scottsdale Stadium. Mr. Brock said he is strongly opposed to leasing the Papago Baseball Complex to the Giants.

Kyle Rogers stated that he is a resident and owner of Baseball Showcase, a youth baseball tournament. He said that the facility is a point of pride for the City of Phoenix. He described how teams from out of state are in awe when they see the complex for the first time. Last year, he said eight tournaments were held at the facility, which entailed over 600 hotel room nights and over \$1 million in economic impact. Mr. Rogers described how tournaments allow kids to get outside, allow families to do something together and enable the kids to exercise and learn how to be teammates. He urged the Board to consider not just the revenue to the city, but what would be taken away from the kids who currently use the facility.

Board Member Lieb stated that his understanding is there would be a short-term impact to youth baseball, but that in the longer term, there will be much-improved facilities and more places for kids to play baseball. He asked staff to confirm that is the case.

Director Erickson responded that the proposal will essentially flip the youth usage from the Papago facility to Indian School Park in Scottsdale, while also increasing opportunities. She described that there are three lit fields at Indian School Park compared to one at Papago; currently, usage is limited to daytime play at Papago. Director Erickson stated that, under the proposal, 29 days of availability are anticipated at the Papago facility, which will grow as schedules get refined. The intent is to add two more fields to Papago, resulting in more availability. Director Erickson also highlighted that the Giants will provide a minimum of four youth clinics, which will be put on by the Giants in Phoenix.

Director Lieb asked if there is any timeframe for the future phases.

Director Erickson responded that the City of Phoenix would give up control of scheduling as a result of the proposal, but reiterated that the Giants and the City of Scottsdale have committed to a minimum of 29 days of availability. Under the proposal, the fields at Indian School Park would become the primary and Papago would supplement them when it's available. The net result is more availability – an increase of about 100 days.



Board Member Bustamante summarized that Papago will still be open for 29 days per year, with more access to the fields during those 29 days. Also, clinics will be offered at Papago for Phoenix youth.

Board Member Perea inquired about who is going to set the prices for use of the fields.

Director Erickson said the prices currently in place in Scottsdale are in line with Phoenix fees and the expectation is that the rates will stay the same, aside from possible increases for inflation.

Board Member Tarver motioned to accept staff's recommendation and recommend to the City Council approval of the IGA with the City of Scottsdale; seconded by Board Member Moya.

Board Member Perea asked a clarification question about the motion and whether it was an approval or a recommendation.

Board Chair Porter confirmed that the motion is a recommendation to the City Council.

Director Erickson stated that this issue is ultimately a City Council decision because it is an IGA.

Item approved 6:0.

## **5. POLICY ITEMS**

### **5a. Request to Negotiate a Lease with Greenbelt Development, LLC to develop and manage an Urban Working Farm and Concessions at Lost Olivos Park**

Board Chair Porter stated that there are hundreds of comment cards from people who are not wishing to speak, as well as approximately 50 cards from people who have requested to speak. She also noted that some of the cards don't indicate if they want to speak, and some are marked only if necessary.

Deputy Director Weiss provided a staff presentation. She began by acknowledging the staff who have been involved in the project. Deputy Director Weiss also walked Board members through the materials in front of them, including letters of support, a City Council petition and corresponding staff report, an email from Katherine Hills, the section of the City Charter dealing with the Board's authority and information about recent interaction between City staff and Arizona State Parks.

Deputy Director Weiss noted that this idea originated not with staff, but the business community. She stated that the Alternate Use Policy, which deals with how staff should treat ideas regarding how to use parks, guided staff in this process. Deputy Director Weiss recapped the previous Board meetings on the topic of Los Olivos Park. Next, she discussed the Request for Proposals (RFP), which she said was conducted between

May and August 2016. The RFP was evaluated in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10, and the procurement code. There were three responsive proposals and Greenbelt, LLC., which received the highest score, chose Los Olivos as the proposed site.

Deputy Director Weiss showed a map orienting the Board to Los Olivos Park's location and the various features of the park. She discussed that Los Olivos Park received Land and Water Conservation Fund (LWCF) funding of \$239,500. Staff has contacted the National Park Service (NPS) through Arizona State Parks and is awaiting a response about having to convert the park. Deputy Director Weiss drew the Board's attention to the recent Board item regarding a conversion at Cortez and Sereno Parks. Next, Deputy Director Weiss discussed the public input process, which she said was part of the RFP at Parks Board direction. She summarized the proposer's public outreach, including 21,450 postcards, three open houses in late 2017 and early 2018, 395 door-knocks, web sites, social media, signage in the park, presentations to area schools and church and media interviews, including AZCentral. In addition, Deputy Director Weiss said staff also directly conducted outreach, including holding open houses in November 2017 and February 2018. Information was also posted on the City's web site and a FAQ was developed. As of March 16, 2018, City staff collected 444 responses and Greenbelt collected 1,284 responses, for a total of 1,728. Of this total, 83.2% of respondents were in favor, 12.8% were in opposition and 4% were neutral. Deputy Director Weiss then discussed the project site itself and the 4.5 acres proposed for the urban working farm. She showed a map with the proposed amenities and corresponding sizes. She stated that there is likely to be a fence around the farm area, with gates, which must be open to the public during park hours.

Board Chair Porter asked how many gates there would be.

Deputy Director Weiss responded that the number of gates has not been determined.

Board Chair Porter asked about a shade structure shown in a conceptual picture of the urban working farm.

Deputy Director Weiss replied that the images are conceptual only and there isn't that level of detail at this stage.

Deputy Director Weiss then discussed the letter of intent. She stated that the letter is not binding, but Greenbelt has agreed to the terms and conditions, and the agreement with Greenbelt would not to be completed until the City hears back from NPS and Arizona State Parks regarding the LWCF issue. Required language would be included in the lease. In addition, the City would retain ownership of the land and the buildings that are constructed. The existing amenities would have to be relocated prior to construction. Deputy Director Weiss discussed the programming that is proposed, including farming and health and nutrition classes. She said it is a key component of the project. Produce grown will be used on-site and cannot be used for commercial purposes. The restaurant component would always have to be a farm-to-table concept

and there would be failsafes in place. Performance bonds and a security deposit would be required.

Board Chair Porter asked if these measures would only apply during construction.

Deputy Director Weiss answered no; they would be required during the entire term of the lease.

Deputy Director Weiss discussed the proposed financial model. The revenue generated for the City would not be lost to the General Fund; it would be used for reinvestment into Los Olivos Park and the rest of the City's park system. The revenue-share would be a certain percentage or set amount, whichever is greater. Deputy Director Weiss stated that the recommendation is to direct staff to enter into lease negotiations with Greenbelt Development, LLC and authorize the Parks and Recreation Director to execute the lease, pending a response from NPS.

Board Member Perea inquired about the LWCF funding and NPS.

Deputy Director Weiss stated that staff has been in contact with the liaison at Arizona State Parks and that everything flows through them to NPS.

Board Chair Porter asked about the federal funds used to purchase the property where Los Olivos Park is located.

Deputy Director Weiss said that the funding was a 50-50 match with federal and local funds and the property is to be used for outdoor recreation use. She stated that there is a conversion process that allows conversion of land for open public recreation use and staff believes the proposed project is permissible under LWCF and don't believe it will need a conversion process. However, if NPS disagrees, then staff is prepared to move forward with a conversion process to maintain the acreage.

Board Member Bustamante asked what happens if NPS denies the request.

Deputy Director Weiss responded that staff can go through the conversion process, which has been done in relation to Sereno and Cortez parks.

Board Chair Porter asked if the City will specify anything with respect to availability of walking pathways.

Deputy Director Weiss replied that walking paths are an essential component.

Director Erickson stated that all designs and plans would have to be approved by the Parks and Recreation Department.

Board Chair Porter stated that she wonders if it is possible for some amount of the revenue to be earmarked for improving the east end of Los Olivos Park. She stated that she is worried about taking away the prime part of the park for the urban working farm.

Attorney Nick Woods gave a presentation on behalf of the proposer. He discussed the outreach conducted by Greenbelt and the numbers of people reached, including social media and web site saturation. He also provided online petition results, door-to-door outreach results and the total number of emails, letters and phone calls received, as well as public open house meeting results. He showed a map of support and opposition within a two- and three-mile radius.

Attorney Brian Stanley gave a presentation in opposition to the proposal. He described his history with Los Olivos Park and how he used a fitness course at the park. He stated that the Board's guidelines for proposed third party uses of parkland includes a requirement to determine that there are no restrictions preventing the proposed use, which staff has not followed, because there is an LWCF Act restriction. He stated that it doesn't make sense to go forward with the proposal only to find out that LWCF requirements will not allow it. Mr. Stanley stated that dining or shopping is considered "public outdoor recreation" under staff's proposal, when in fact it isn't. He also said that it could be valuable education, but it's not public outdoor recreation. Mr. Stanley stated that staff testified they submitted a proposal to Arizona State Parks to be transmitted to NPS, but it is actually just a 100-word email and some answers to questions. He doesn't believe this meets what is contained in the Code of Federal Regulations (CFRs). Mr. Stanley concluded by saying that, under the City ordinance creating the Board, there is no mention of the Board being able to sell or lease land.

Board Member Lieb asked who Mr. Stanley represents.

Mr. Stanley responded that he represents property owners in the area who call themselves "Concerned Citizens for Los Olivos Park."

Assistant City Attorney Patty Boland stated that she has worked closely with Deputy Director Weiss and has gone through the manual for the use of LWCF funds. She stated that Deputy Director Weiss is correct that it allows restaurants as concessions, as they are incidental to outdoor recreation use. Ms. Boland also said that staff has known from the beginning that buy-in is needed from Arizona State Parks and NPS and if they don't give consent, a conversion can be done. She said that conversions have been done before and are actually in the process of doing it in relation to the Loop 202 South Mountain Freeway and it is not an unprecedented action. Ms. Boland stated that she is not sure that conversion will be necessary, but even if it was, it would not violate the rules governing the fund.

Board Chair Porter asked if a land conversion would need to have a geographic nexus to Los Olivos Park.

Deputy Director Weiss responded that this could be similar to Cortez and Sereno parks, where the converted land was far away from the parks in question.

Board Member Perea stated that he went to one of the public open houses and saw the Street Transportation Department there. He asked if the Police or Fire departments were involved.

Director Erickson responded that would be part of the plan review process. She stated that the Street Transportation Department gave their opinion about certain elements.

Tarek El Dokor stated that he lives two blocks away from the park. He supports the project and thinks the farm is a great idea. He strongly urged the Board to support the project.

James Mathien stated that he lives in the townhouses on the north side of the park. His issue is with the traffic impacts on 28<sup>th</sup> Street and how it can be mitigated. He stated that 28<sup>th</sup> Street is a minor collector street, which the City defines as carrying between 1,000 and 8,000 trips per day. Currently, it carries 7,800 trips per day. It could carry up to 15,000 trips per day, at which point it would resemble Osborne Road. Mr. Mathien said about 1,100 additional trips per day would be generated by the urban working farm and more analysis needs to be done.

John Rosnek asked who is going to handle the mortgage on the property for 40 years, which he said is a long time for a restaurant to survive. He testified that there is a restaurant two doors away and asked "why do we need another one?" He also stated that the traffic was only studied for one day, which doesn't provide enough information. Mr. Rosnek believes there are a lot of questions that need to be answered.

Katherine Hills stated that the Board possesses a tremendous amount of power and she hopes they use it to say "no" to the proposed farm. She said the project would permanently install a private use that violates the deed restrictions on the park. She also stated that the Parks and Recreation Department failed to meet the criteria of its own policy, especially regarding City engagement. She believes there was no timely, sincere or meaningful public discourse or debate. Also, the project fails to meet the criteria of the RFP. Ms. Hills believes the project should get no further consideration. She has talked to hundreds of park users who didn't know about the proposal and the majority of people she spoke with are opposed to the project. She doesn't believe the statistics give an accurate picture. She asked the Board to give the park the reverence and protection it deserves by voting "no."

Tracy Antley stated that she lives north of the park and uses it often to walk her dog and exercise. She has seen developers come into the neighborhood, tear down houses and build multi-level townhomes. She believes the urban working farm will cause disruption, cut down trees and move the disc golf course. She stated that she doesn't think it's a bad project, but the neighborhood isn't a good fit for it.

Molly Powell stated that she moved to Phoenix from Anaheim, California 12 years ago, and the proposal is more than a farm; as it includes a lot of buildings. Additionally, she noted that Sprouts is a 10-minute walk away and there are farms in the vicinity of the City already. She asked the Board to show the rest of the country that we value our parks and to keep the space green.

RB Schoeneman stated that he lives directly across from the park. Mr. Schoeneman stated that after reading the description of the agreement, it is meant to preserve Los Olivos Park, not to open it up to a farm and restaurant. He also said he has disappointments with the process and he hope things are done better next time. He thanked the Board for its service.

Erick Lundgren stated that he is a biologist and talked about how people should coexist with non-human lives. He said he believes that we are more and more disconnected from food and the urban working farm project has a chance to allow a new generation to experience the farming process and shape the future.

Tom Waldeck stated that he is President/CEO of Keep Phoenix Beautiful, an affiliate of Keep America Beautiful. He referenced the Mountain View community garden and the community garden and demonstration project at the Collier location, known as PHX Renews. He said these are community-changing projects and that gardens and urban farming raise property values and lower crime. He encouraged the Board to vote "yes."

Douglas Righi urged the Board to vote the project down. Mr. Righi stated that he has lived by the park for 35 years and he has seen trees disappear. He encouraged the Board to preserve the space. He also stated that the project serves no need in the area and should not be allowed at the expense of the park. Mr. Righi stated that organic food is widely available. In 50 years, he believes the urban working farm will morph into something else.

Gilda Lima asked the Board to keep certain issues in mind when they vote: What is the environmental impact of the project? She stated that no study has been done and it amounts to a giveaway of green space. How will it contribute to the urban heat island? How will the removal of trees affect the tree canopy? What will be the carbon impact? How much refuse will be produced? What impact will it have on the school system? Ms. Lima stated that the decision by the Board will either forever change the nature of the park or preserve it.

Eric Gorsenger testified that he is a former member of the Board and he loves the project. He stated that land in Phoenix is treated as a commodity, but park land should not be. As more development occurs, Mr. Gorsenger said that green space will be at a premium. Ultimately, he believes this is the right project, but the wrong place. He asked that, if the Board approves the proposal, they entertain two modest accommodations: that 20% of the revenue generated be earmarked specifically for Los Olivos Park and that land be required to be preserved as turf. Mr. Gorsenger thanked the Board for their service.

Bruce Hilby stated that he represents the Camelback High School community network and supports the project and supports the renaissance of Camelback High School. Mr. Hilby commented he has seen Aric Mei presentation on the project. He said that the school principal could attend the meeting, but sent a letter, which Mr. Hilby read aloud, expressing support for the project.

Mike Lindsey testified that he and his wife support the project. Mr. Lindsey stated that he has known Matt Moore and his family many years. Mr. Lindsey discussed his long involvement in agriculture and soil.

Tamara Stanger stated that she spends a lot of time in the area and works with children teaching them about agriculture and healthy eating habits. She said that having this project will give families an opportunity to learn about agriculture and change the way they view food.

Rodger Loar stated that he lives two blocks from the park and works as a pastor in the neighborhood. He is a graduate of Camelback High School and his children go to school in the area. Mr. Loar said he very much cares about the neighborhood and he was angry when he first learned about the proposal, but as he listened, he learned that much of the information he had been given was wrong or exaggerated. He was impressed by Matt and Aric and believes the urban working farm will be an asset to the community, especially with all of the schools within walking distance. Mr. Loar stated that he fully supports the project and urged the Board to approve it.

Zach Walker said he is a Phoenix native and currently lives in Gilbert. Mr. Walker spoke about being a professional disc golfer. He testified that he and his wife designed the disc golf course at Los Olivos Park. He said that since the course was installed, more traffic has come, pushing problems with vagrancy out of the park. Mr. Walker said he personally supports the project and, as far as he knows, the majority of disc golfers support it.

Jill Blewett stated that her grandparents built their home in 1955 and attended Camelback High School. Ms. Blewett stated that she is very invested in the neighborhood and excited about the project and can't wait to see it happen.

Dwayne Allen testified that he and his wife own Grapefruit Rum Bar. He said they support sustainability in local food culture. Mr. Allen said that, over the years, the City has given up farmland to urban sprawl. He stated that he is excited about the project, as he believes it is a step in the right direction for the city. Mr. Allen discussed how we have to change the way we view public lands and said that we are hamstrung to find good, local, organic food, which is oftentimes very expensive.

Carolyn Lavender stated that she supports the project. She has lived in her house since 1987 and wants to live in a City that gives fresh ideas a chance. Ms. Lavender stated that she was glad the RFP happened. She also said she has discussed the proposal

with people in the park and 80% of those she spoke to supported it, especially younger people.

Rick Engelmann testified that he has used Devonshire Senior Center as well as the park and he is excited about this new venture being put forth. Mr. Engelmann said he can picture himself walking through the garden with his grandkids. He thanked the Board in advance for voting "yes."

Terri Nacke stated that agriculture is the foundation of civilization and she can't wait to get involved in something so rewarding. Mr. Nacke said she is a fifth generation Phoenician and has spent 25 years pioneering food security, having helped to open up many of the Valley's farmers markets. She said she hopes the Board votes "yes."

Ryan Ingram testified that he lives on the east end of the park and his family is very excited about the concept of the urban working farm. Mr. Ingram said he wants to see the east end of the park get increased use.

Lauren Bailey said she lives across from the project and is part of the culinary community. Ms. Bailey stated that she is excited for the project; not just for the neighborhood, but for the culinary community. She stated that Matt Moore and Aric Mei are excellent operators.

Jon Kitchell stated that projects such as this are tough and he discussed his experience with the Windsor restaurant and the Newton. He said the project will be a wonderful asset to the neighborhood and that this type of project is what makes the City more exciting and more notable across the country. Mr. Kitchell said he hoped the Board votes "yes"

John Cunningham stated that he has lived in the area for 40 years and supports the project. Mr. Cunningham asked people to recall downtown Phoenix 30 years ago and compared it to today, when it is vibrant. He urged the Board to realize this project will create vibrancy and asked that they please vote to move the project forward.

Gennaro Garcia testified that he is an artist and discussed how artists are important to the fabric of the culture. Mr. Garcia said he has enormous respect for Matt Moore. He said that through this collaboration, the whole City will have the opportunity to learn about food and sustainable practices.

Maya Dailey testified that she is a small organic farmer in the Valley and she is very passionate about the impacts of farms on the community. Ms. Dailey discussed the environmental, health, community and spiritual reasons. She stated that she believes we are getting far removed from the natural world and small farms have the ability to unite communities and build healthy systems. Ms. Dailey said we should encourage more small farms and think about open space differently. She said the urban working farm is a pilot project that needs to be supported.



Keith Horm stated that he supports the project and he thinks it's a great opportunity for the community. Mr. Horm said it will bring culture to the area and change the whole community and the park for the better.

Joyce Moderow stated that she is a resident of the area for the past 27 years. She talked about how no City funding will go into the proposed development.

Bernie Rivera stated he is a Pastor at a local church, and even though he hasn't lived in the area long, his first thought is about the children in the area. He stated that a farm in the area embodies a healthy living style and supports the idea.

Monica Castillo stated she was raised in Tucson and is an active user of the resources that parks and recreation has. Ms. Castillo stated she doesn't live in the area, however, she is passionate about this project.

Colton Tuttle stated that the area is becoming increasingly dense. Mr. Tuttle said that we are kept in the dark about where our food comes from and this project offers an opportunity to cultivate a better understanding. He asked the Board to vote "yes" for future generations.

Charles Johnson stated that he can't understand why the Board would vote "no" on the project and urged the Board members to please vote "yes."

Doug Robson expressed his enthusiasm and support for the project. Mr. Robson said he believes this project will be a game-changer for Phoenix and is a model that could be replicated. Mr. Robson also he said he believes nutrition is extremely important.

Michael Widener testified that he has served as a zoning adjustment hearing officer for the City. He stated that the education component is very important, as youth of the community critically need more education on food. Mr. Widener commented on how we don't understand where our food comes from. He asked the Board to please not be put off by a big idea. He stated that any time place making occurs, there is pushback, and what makes vanguard communities is seizing on big ideas like this one.

Jason Boblick testified that he lives north of Los Olivos Park with his wife and kids and they came to the meeting to voice their strong support. Mr. Boblick said that in their nine years in the community, they've been to the park thousands of times. He said that soccer practices and games are held within the proposed site, but that it only takes up a small part of the site and there are always open fields available, which are large enough to accommodate playing soccer. Mr. Boblick said the farm will be a place to learn about our food, break bread, get to know each other and come together and become more cohesive as a community.

Jennifer Boblick stated that she has lived in the neighborhood for about nine years, and stated that having the educational component in the park would benefit her kids, as well as the teachers and families at nearby schools. Ms. Boblick stated that the urban

working farm would be a great benefit for the park, which she said is currently not utilized to its full potential. Ms. Boblick stated that if the project isn't approved, she would like to see other improvements made to the park. She asked the Board to please vote in favor of the project.

Attorney Brian Stanley said that he agrees with the comments about seeing more care taken, and improvements made, to Los Olivos Park, but he said that can be addressed in ways other than approving the project. Mr. Stanley stated that this will not be a source of sustainable produce and noted that, under the proposal, the produce can't be sold anywhere else. Mr. Stanley noted that there are already lots of good restaurants in the area.

Attorney Nick Wood stated that the city's RFP asked for exactly what his client proposed. Mr. Wood discussed his client's outreach and the overwhelming support for the proposal. Mr. Wood reiterated that the proposal is a response to what was asked of potential proposers.

Matt Moore commended the forward thinking of staff and the public at the meeting. He stated that this is a transformative moment for the City and he was pleased and humbled to see the community coming together.

Sasha Raj testified that she doesn't live in Phoenix, but she drove to the meeting in traffic because she wanted to express her support for the project. She told the Board she wished this project was in her own neighborhood. Ms. Raj stated that she wholeheartedly supports the project and hopes to see it flourish, not just here, but hopefully in her own community.

Board Member Lieb thanked everyone for their participation in the meeting. He stated that this was an emotional issue for many people. Board Member Lieb said that, when the proposal first came to his attention, he sat down with staff to say that an RFP had to be done and it had to be transparent.

Board Member Lieb left the meeting at 8:15 p.m.

Board Member Tarver stated that she had an opportunity to look at the plans and meet with the project team and she feels very confident with moving forward with a motion and a vote.

Board Member Perea thanked both parties for all of their work and said that hopefully they can continue working on the issue.

Board Member Lieb rejoined the meeting telephonically at 8:16 p.m.

Board Member Lieb stated that he was glad to hear from restaurant owners that they are supportive. Additionally, he said that a big litmus test for him was that the economics are fair. Board Member Lieb stated that he is very supportive and he

thanked staff for doing a great job. He also stated that it was good to hear from the Assistant City Attorney that she is comfortable and that we are meeting the test of the statutes. Board Member Lieb said that this is an exciting concept for the area and he is excited to see it come to fruition.

Board Member Bustamante commended everyone for putting in so much time and energy and attending meetings to shape the project's direction. She stated that initially her biggest concern was community engagement; as a professional community developer, she knows how hard it is to get people to show up and collaborate. She stated that the process seems very thorough and she sees this as a wonderful pilot program. She also commented that it is impressive to see so many restaurateurs rallying around another restaurateur.

Board Member Moya stated that his number one concern was also community involvement and he now feels very comfortable with the proposal. He stated that he was a little hesitant at first, because he has seen community gardens come and go, but he knows this one is different.

Board Chair Porter stated that she believes the Board needs to take another look at Boards Policy 2.9; currently, she said, there are no guidelines about what the Board should ask for. She said that Los Olivos Park is a well-activated park and that it's not neglected. Board Chair Porter also stated that, in the future, outreach by proposers needs to be at the caliber of what City staff does and it needs to be neutral. She referred to the wording of promotional materials put out by the proposer. Board Chair Porter stated that she has been on the fence about the proposal and is still troubled about it. She said she feels sympathetic to the idea that it is the right project at the wrong place. She remarked that the Board isn't here to reflect what people want right now; the Board members have to think about this park now and forever, and it's hard to give up a significant part of the park in a part of town that is becoming denser.

Board Member Lieb stated that the applicant has gone way beyond what they were asked to do with many avenues of outreach and has shown wide support.

Board Member Bustamante stated that she agrees with Board Member Lieb and would like to proceed with making a motion accepting staff's recommendation.

Board Member Bustamante motioned to approve staff's recommendation; seconded by Board Member Moya.

Item approved 5:1.

## **6. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Drew Peterson stated that he was there to speak about the North Building. He said that he would like to see a brightly-lit auditorium that is dedicated to the arts, which are growing every day in the City.

**7. BOARD CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

Board Chair Porter noted the grand opening of the Keep Phoenix Beautiful Community Garden at Mountain View Park.

**8. BOARD COMMENTS & REQUESTS**

Board Chair Porter stated that she would like an item on the North Building and for staff to either put out an RFP or provide a timeline.

Board Member Moya gave kudos to everyone at the meeting for their time and dedication and stated that he respected that everyone put in the time.

**9. DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Director Inger Erickson highlighted the Maryvale Baseball Park renovation, the refurbishing of 8 City of Phoenix basketball courts, new FitPHX programs (WalkPHX Wednesday s' and Fall into Fitness), and the McDowell Mountain Music Festival. Director Erickson also noted the local Channel 3 and 5 highlighted a the City's most popular parks in one of their newscast, with Encanto, Hance, Moon Valley and Steele Indian School Parks making the list.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:45 p.m.