

160472

**CITY OF PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL  
SUSTAINABILITY SUBCOMMITTEE  
SUMMARY MINUTES  
MAY 16, 2007**

City Hall, 12<sup>th</sup> floor  
200 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85003

**Council Members Present**

Councilman Doug Lingner, Chair  
Councilman Claude Mattox  
Councilman Greg Stanton

**City Staff Present**

Cynthia Seelhammer	Eric Gudino	John Trujillo
PJ Jasso	Mark Leonard	Liz Paulus
Amber Cole	Terrence Gellenbeck	Tom Buschatzke
Karen O'Regan	Eric Kropp	Ken Vonderscher
Stacy Kolegas	Ron Serio	Greg Montes
Cynthia Parker	Al Shiya	Lyn Williams
Gaye Knight	Dimitrios Laloudakis	Brian Suggs
Carolyn Bristo	Theresa Foster	

**Public Present**

Cassius McChesney, APS	Dr. Mike Crimmins, Univ. of Arizona
Kendra Cea, APS	Edward Masley, AZ Republic
Kate Widland, SRP	Penny Allee Taylor, Southwest Gas

**1. Call to Order**

Chairman Lingner called the meeting to order at 10:12 a.m. with Councilmen Mattox and Stanton present.

**2. Approval of the April 18, 2007 Sustainability Subcommittee Minutes**

Councilman Stanton moved approval of the minutes, seconded by Councilman Mattox. The motion passed 3:0.

**3. Film Plastic Bag Update**

Mr. Mark Leonard, Public Works Director, introduced Mr. John Trujillo, Assistant Public Works Director and Mr. Terry Gellenbeck, Solid Waste Administrative Analyst. He stated that plastic bags are a major source of litter, are extremely slow to degrade and are difficult to recycle. He stated further that staff was recommending a gradual approach to include initially a voluntary recycle and reuse program, with a mandatory recycling program and a possible outright ban as future options.

Chairman Lingner stated he and Councilman Stanton had met with people in the industry.

Councilman Stanton stated he would like to have a representative from the industry come and talk about the issue and directed staff to look at the California Statute on plastic bag use.

Mr. Leonard stated staff had been researching other cities and it appeared most are at a similar point in evaluating the issue.

Mr. Trujillo stated that California is working on a six-year pilot program which includes in-store recycling programs and penalties for non compliance.

Councilman Stanton asked if stores are required to keep track of the number of bags leaving the store and the number of bags recycled. Mr. Trujillo stated he did not know. Councilman Stanton stated that to do so did not seem to be too onerous and it would be good to track this number.

Chairman Lingner stated it is important to work with others in the industry and the focus should be on recycling and reuse before consideration of an outright ban. He said a public awareness campaign was needed and retailers should be involved to provide in-store bag collection points. He stated further partnerships need to be created and requested staff to work on a policy that would require stores to participate.

Chairman Lingner requested Ms. Cynthia Seelhammer, Deputy City Manager to work with staff and partners in the community and report back before the summer break. He stated she should partner with the City's Public Information Office and Neighborhood Services.

Councilman Stanton stated staff should identify all local providers who recycle the plastic bags to develop programs and increase drop off locations around the city.

Chairman Lingner thanked staff for the presentation.

**4. Public Transit Department Sustainability Efforts: Bus Shelter Maintenance and Solar Energy**

Councilman Stanton moved to continue this item until the next meeting, seconded by Councilman Mattox. The motion passed 3:0.

**5. Climate Change Information**

Ms. Karen O'Regan, Environmental Programs Manager, introduced Ms. Gaye Knight, Environmental Programs Specialist, and Dr. Michael Crimmins, Assistant Professor, Climate Science Extension Specialist, Department of Soil, Water and Environmental Science, at the University of Arizona.

Dr. Crimmins discussed the global climate system, the green house effect and stated that temperatures have been rising well above the average over the last fifty years. He stated the Intergovernmental Panel of Climate Change included 4,000 scientists around the world who believe that the green house effect is adversely

affecting the earth's climate and increasing temperatures. He stated carbon dioxide and temperature variations occur in concert and current levels are higher than historical trends.

Dr. Crimmins stated in summary that greenhouse gases (GHG's) are accumulating in the earth's atmosphere as a result of human activities and causing surface temperatures to rise. He said temperatures are projected to continue to rise and that even with stabilization of GHG's now, there will still be additional warming over the next 50 years due to the lagged response in oceans.

Dr. Crimmins stated stabilization of carbon dioxide levels could help to stabilize temperatures.

Councilman Stanton asked Dr. Crimmins to explain stabilization. Dr. Crimmins stated that modeling methods have been used to track changes in carbon dioxide emissions and the impact on temperatures. He stated the results indicated that reducing CO<sub>2</sub> levels could reduce temperatures.

Councilman Stanton asked if the modeling methods were part of the Kyoto Protocol. Dr. Crimmins stated they were, but indicated that the Kyoto Protocol modeling was not his expertise.

Councilman Stanton stated the subcommittee is one policy making body of many and any policies created by the City of Phoenix would not have a direct impact on the industries who are the primary source of emissions, since these industries are not regulated by the City. He asked Dr. Crimmins if it was clear that human factors have caused increases in the earth's temperatures. Dr. Crimmins stated yes and that this is the consensus among climate scientists.

Councilman Stanton asked what effect global warming had on water supplies. Dr. Crimmins stated he was not an expert in hydrology. He stated that precipitation models vary widely on the potential impacts of global warming on water supplies. While it is clear that CO<sub>2</sub> emissions increase global temperatures, the impact on precipitation is much more difficult to predict. Councilman Stanton asked if he knew of a colleague at the University of Arizona who could present information to the subcommittee about this topic. Dr. Crimmins recommended Kathy Jacobs with the Arizona Water Institute.

Councilman Mattox stated that the information presented appeared to be consistent with previous presentations he has heard.

Chairman Lingner stated that he would like this information, and a future presentation about the effect of greenhouse gases on water supplies, to be combined and presented to the full City Council.

Councilman Stanton asked Dr. Crimmins if he could be available in the future to present to the full City Council. Dr. Crimmins stated yes.

Councilman Mattox stated he would like future decisions on these issues to be forwarded to the Land Use, Environment & Natural Resources Subcommittee as that subcommittee would ultimately be responsible for any policy decisions recommended to the full City Council.

Councilman Mattox stated he was not ready to adopt a City resolution on climate change and would like to first meet with the consultant who will perform a carbon inventory before making any decisions about a resolution. Ms. O'Regan stated a consultant had not yet been hired. Councilman Mattox stated he thought staff had someone in mind and asked staff to clarify the request for a consultant. Ms. O'Regan stated staff would like to issue an RFP to hire a consultant and would also like to join ICLEI to obtain the required software to conduct the emissions inventory.

Councilman Stanton asked if ICLEI set the goals for organizations or if they just assist in goal development. Ms. O'Regan stated they would assist staff with goal development after the emissions inventory was complete. Councilman Stanton asked if an ICLEI representative would evaluate only the City of Phoenix emissions or the entire community. Ms. O'Regan stated that ICLEI recommended doing the inventory of City operations first, then the community inventory. Ms. O'Regan stated that ICLEI would assist with both evaluations and that the membership fee is \$7,000.

Councilman Stanton stated the subcommittee needed to set an ambitious agenda. He stated they are not the regulatory body for these matters, however they will be setting a standard for others.

Councilman Mattox stated he agreed to move forward with the RFP process for the emissions inventory. He stated he would like the evaluation conducted prior to setting goals to ensure they are attainable.

Councilman Stanton stated he would prefer to consider goals which could be accomplished within the next few years.

Chairman Lingner stated the first challenge would be to hire the consultant and establish goals that are based on fact. He stated they would need to build a consensus.

Ms. Knight stated the consultant will provide a list of goals and expected outcomes to assist with identifying realistic goals.

Chairman Lingner stated he agreed with going forward on an RFP for the consultant but wanted to wait on the resolution. He stated he supported becoming part of the Kyoto Protocol and he did not want any prohibition on communication with potential consulting firms. He stated further he wanted Ms. Seelhammer to discuss the issue with each councilmember to establish a consensus.

Councilman Stanton stated it is important to focus on policy ideas through this process and to ultimately develop a work plan.

Councilman Mattox stated he wanted to insure the final resolution included realistic goals. He stated that the Land Use, Environment and Natural Resources Subcommittee would need to be updated and involved in the goal setting process. He stated further he would like to have a representative from ICLEI at a future meeting.

Councilman Mattox moved approval for staff to issue an RFP for a consultant to conduct a GHG emission inventory of City of Phoenix operations and authorizing

staff to join ICLEI. Councilman Stanton seconded the motion. The motion passed 3:0.

**6. Biomass Technology – Green Waste, Cellulose Fiber, Ethanol and Landfill Gas-to-Energy**

Mr. Trujillo stated that the term biomass involved the conversion of plant materials into fuel sources used to produce energy. He stated there were several government incentives to promote renewable energy sources. He stated further the Arizona Corporation Commission would require 15% of the state's energy production to come from renewable energy sources by 2025 and biomass technology would comprise part of the 15%.

(Councilman Stanton left the room at 11:35 a.m.)

Councilman Mattox asked if there was a benefit to separating green waste. Mr. Trujillo stated efforts had been made to do so and that to increase this separation would involve an educational program. Councilman Mattox asked if a third waste container specifically for green waste was being considered. Mr. Leonard stated they had considered this option and a pilot program is under consideration for a section of the community.

Councilman Mattox asked about the effect of removing green waste from the landfills from a methane perspective. Mr. Leonard stated he was not sure. Councilman Mattox stated he would like someone to look into the benefit of separating the green waste versus using it to produce methane gas at the landfills.

Chairman Lingner stated he would like to know the impact separation would have at the landfills. He asked if staff was aware of anyone who could answer this. Mr. Leonard stated staff could research other programs for empirical data.

Mr. Trujillo stated that domestic biomass programs involved the conversion of garbage and wood into energy. He stated local organizations were involved in biomass technologies and developing new ideas to produce energy from various sources.

Chairman Lingner stated he was familiar with Genahol and their plan to hire people to sort through waste streams to sort out materials to use to produce ethanol products. He stated he was not sure if this could work for the City but encouraged staff to pursue partnerships to collect green waste out of landfills in order to produce alternative fuels. Mr. Leonard stated staff could look into this further.

Chairman Lingner asked Ms. Seelhammer if a future agenda item involved discussions with the Intergovernmental Programs Office (IGP) regarding biomass legislation. Ms. Seelhammer stated IGP is tracking legislation and stated Ms. Karen Peters, IGP Director, would update the Subcommittee at a future meeting. Chairman Lingner asked Ms. Seelhammer to schedule a presentation by Ms. Peters for a future meeting.

**7. Mercury Lamp Recycling**

Chairman Lingner stated this item was informational and a report was included in the agenda packet. There were no questions from the subcommittee.

**8. Use of Lighting Control Motion Sensor Devices at City Facilities**

Councilman Mattox stated the implementation of motion sensor devices occurred a few years ago and they were effective.

Chairman Lingner stated the program could be expanded to include restrooms.

(Councilman Stanton entered the room at 11:49 a.m.)

**9. Use of Synthetic Motor Oil in City's Fleet**

Mr. Leonard introduced Ms. Carolyn Bristo, Assistant Public Works Director, and Ron Serio, Deputy Public Works Director.

Ms. Bristo stated the City Council Report included in the agenda packet provided information on the City's use of synthetic motor oil. She stated the City is using a synthetic blend and not 100 percent synthetic oil.

Ms. Bristo stated the advantage of using synthetic motor oil is it allowed for longer intervals between oil changes, thereby reducing oil consumption and disposal. She stated the disadvantage was the cost and that synthetic motor oil was approximately three times as costly as petroleum based oil. She stated further Ford and General Motors did not object to the use of synthetic oils but required oil changes to occur at the same intervals as petroleum oil in order to continue their warranties.

Councilman Mattox asked why staff was not conducting a pilot program on a small number of fleet vehicles to determine if there was a benefit. He stated utilization decisions should not be based on manufacturer's recommendations alone.

Mr. Ron Serio stated vehicles in the fleet with expired warranties could be used in such a pilot program.

Councilman Mattox asked the duration of the manufacturer's warranty. Mr. Serio stated it was typically 36,000 miles and General Motors recently offered a five year, 100,000 mile warranty.

(Councilman Stanton left the room at 11:56 a.m.)

Councilman Mattox suggested that the City offer to conduct a pilot program for the manufacturer.

Chairman Lingner stated we could offer our vehicles as test vehicles and request an alternative warranty, which would benefit both parties.

Councilman Mattox asked if there was an after market for synthetic oil waste.

Mr. Leonard stated he was not sure and would look into this.

Councilman Mattox stated it would not make sense to use 100 percent synthetic oil if we would later have to store and dispose of it.

Chairman Linger thanked staff for the report.

**10. Call to the Public**

There was no response to the call.

**11. Request for Future Agenda Items**

Chairman Linger stated he would like to add presentations by IGP and JCLEI to the upcoming agenda item list. He also stated he would like staff to consider scheduling a couple of meetings over the summer break, if possible.

**12. Adjournment**

Chairman Lingner adjourned the meeting at 12:04 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Amber Cole  
Management Assistant II