185902

PHOENIX HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Final Meeting Minutes

Date: November 20, 2023
Time: 4:30 p.m.
Location: Hybrid Meeting: In-person at City Council Chambers & Virtual via Webex

Commission Members Present	Staff Present
Dan Garcia, Chair	Helana Ruter
Tricia Amato, Vice Chair	Kevin Weight
Brenda Thomson	Desiree Aranda
Keely Varvel Hartsell (late arrival)	Emma Collins
Dan Klocke (virtual)	Bridget Collins
Greta Rayle (virtual)	Paul Li
	Jodey Elsner (virtual)
	Crystal Carrancho (virtual)
	Cletus Montoya (virtual)
Commission Members Absent	**Staff Absent**
Taz Khatri	
Christina Noble	

1.	**Call meeting to order** Chair Garcia verified that a quorum was established and called the meeting to order at 4:45 p.m.	**Dan Garcia, HP Commission Chair**
2.	**Introduction of Commission Members and Staff** The Commission members and HP staff made their introductions.	**HP Commission & Staff**
3.	**Review of meeting minutes from the monthly meeting held on October 16, 2023.** **Action Requested:** Approval of minutes Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments about the draft minutes from the monthly meeting. None were posed. Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on the draft minutes from the October 16th monthly meeting. Vice Chair Amato made a motion to approve the minutes as submitted for the October 16th HP Commission monthly meeting. Commissioner Thomson seconded the motion. The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes	**HP Commission**

	Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes Approved 6 – 0.	

4.	Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. Z-52-23-8, Greenlee-Hammond House/Virgil J. Berry Real Estate & Insurance Agency, at 1321 E Washington St
	
	Action Requested: Recommendation on Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay Zoning
	
	Chair Garcia invited Kevin Weight to present this item.
	
	Mr. Weight mentioned that Sarah Stockham, of the Long Range Planning Team, would be available for zoning-related questions. He then shared some background information about this rezoning application case # Z-52-23-8, as follows:
	• 4.72 acres
	• Southeast and southwest corners of 13th Street and Washington Street
	• Request rezoning from C-3 TOD-1 and R-5 RI TOD-1 to WU Code T5:7 EG and WU Code T5:7 EG HP
	• Proposal: mixed use including multifamily residential, hotel, and general retail; and a Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay
	• General plan designation: commercial
	• Within 400 feet of the 12th Street / Washington / Jefferson light rail stations
	• Major Urban Center: destination retail / entertainment, mid-rise living, mid-rise office, hotels
	• Heights from 4 to 8 stories
	• Eastlake-Garfield TOD Policy:
	  ○ Zoning Plan (T5:7 and T5:5)
	  ○ Mixed-use (office, residential, retail)
	  ○ Single-family residential
	  ○ Housing element (mixed-use)
	  ○ Land use element (redevelop)
	• Conceptual Site Plan
	  ○ Two 8-story buildings
	  ○ East - hotel (150 rooms)
	  ○ West – mixed-use (multifamily, 1st floor retail)
	  ○ 456 parking spaces
	  ○ Frontage type – storefront
	  ○ Streetscape improvements (detached sidewalks, shade)
	
	Mr. Weight then reviewed the HP overlay zoning eligibility criteria, as follows:
	1. Age (at least 50 years old or exceptionally significant)
		Kevin Weight, HP Staff

2. Integrity (location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, association)
3. Significance
    a. Associated with events or patterns of events significant in Phoenix history
    b. Associated with persons significant in Phoenix history
    c. Represents a type, period, or method of construction; represents the work of a master; or has high artistic values
    d. Has yielded or has the potential to yield information about Phoenix history or prehistory

Mr. Weight then reviewed the evaluation of the subject property and said that the subject property meets the eligibility criteria for HP overlay zoning. The property meets the age requirement, having been built in 1926. It also has very good historic integrity, with few alterations, despite having been converted from a residence to an office. The property is significant under Criteria A, B, and C, as follows:

- Criterion A significance for its association with African American history in Phoenix (1868-1970)
- Criterion B significance for its association with several important i
- individuals:
    - **Nello B Greenlee** – Prominent doctor & surgeon; The subject property was built for him in 1926
    - **Roy A Lee** – First principal of Carver High School; Owned property following Dr. Greenlee's death in 1934
    - **Wade H Hammond** – One of first African American bandmasters in U.S. Army and prominent in civic affairs in Phoenix
        - Member of Phoenix Housing Authority
        - President of Colored Professionals & Business Club of Phoenix
        - Founding Member & First President of Phoenix Urban League
    - **Virgil J Berry** – Prominent Phoenix businessman; Acquired subject property in 1964
        - Graduated from Phoenix College and Arizona State College; Awarded B.S. in Business Administration
        - Worked for Lincoln Ragsdale Sr.
            - Ragsdale Mortuary
            - Ragsdale Realty & Insurance Agency
            - Valley Life Insurance Company (Vice President)
        - 1953-Created the Webb, Williams & Berry Real Estate Brokers and Insurance Agency
        - 1960-Opened his own real estate & insurance company with his wife, Doris and brother, Luther
        - 1964-Moved his business into former residence at 1321 East Washington Street
            - Member of Phoenix Real Estate Board

- Worked as Supervisor for City of Phoenix Concentrated Employment Program

- Criterion C significance for its architecture as a fine example of Southwest-style architecture (regional mix of Spanish Colonial Revival and Pueblo Revival styles)
    - Designed by C. Louis Kelley (architect)
    - Constructed by T.L. Weatherford (contractor)

Mr. Weight mentioned that there was another structure on the site, the Loy-Ong Building, 1246 East Jefferson Street, which is proposed for demolition. This structure is significant but was recommended as not eligible due to integrity loss per the Asian American Property Survey. He said that HP staff has been working with Mr. Berry and requested that he acknowledge and document the history of this Chinese grocery on the site after it is demolished. The building was previously owned by Wing F. Ong, who was a Chinese American state legislator and attorney. He said that Mr. Berry feels strongly about promoting history in Eastlake Park, and he wants to help acknowledge the history of this building on site.

Mr. Weight reviewed that staff findings, as follows:

1. The proposal is consistent with the General Plan Land Use Map designation and the Eastlake-Garfield TOD Policy Plan vision for the site.
2. The proposal will redevelop an underutilized site with a mixed-use development, including multifamily housing, retail, and a hotel that will contribute to the mix of uses in the area.
3. As stipulated, the proposal provides enhanced pedestrian and bicycle amenities consistent with the Eastlake-Garfield TOD Policy Plan, Comprehensive Bicycle Master Plan, Tree and Shade Master Plan, and the Complete Streets Guiding Principles.
4. The property at 1321 East Washington Street meets the significance, age, and integrity requirements for HP overlay zoning set forth in Section 807.D of the Zoning Ordinance.

In conclusion, Mr. Weight said that staff recommends approval of the HP overlay zoning, subject to stipulations. He said the case went before the Central City Village Planning Committee on November 13, 2023, which recommended approval by a vote of 11 to 3. The three no votes disagreed with some of the stipulations. However, all 14 committee members supported the project and the HP overlay zoning. In the next steps, the case would go before the Planning Commission on December 7, 2023, followed by the City Council on January 3, 2024. He also mentioned that the property owner, Mr. Berry and his business partner, Mr. Harris, were in attendance and available for questions as well.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Weight for his presentation. He then verified that Ms. Stockham was not presenting on this item, but she was available for questions.

Next, Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any questions or comments on this item.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell asked for more information about the Chinese grocery store that is located on the subject property.

Mr. Weight clarified that the store was built in 1925 and was later owned by Wing F. Ong in the 1940s. In recent years, the storefronts were modified and the building was stuccoed, resulting in a loss of historic integrity. The HP Office has kept the building on its radar for possible reversal of alterations and restoring it. Per the 2007 Asian American Property Survey, the building was recommended as not eligible. He also met with Mr. Berry to discuss options for keeping the building on site. However, there were no feasible options to retain the building within the proposed plans for the site. The historic residence at 1321 East Washington Street was better situated on the site to include in the project. He stated that the HP Office was happy to work with Mr. Berry in moving forward with preserving the African American historic property and adding it to the Phoenix Historic Property Register.

Chair Garcia asked whether the grocery building could be considered eligible if it was re-evaluated now. Mr. Weight responded that it was possible. Chair Garcia clarified that the grocery store was not part of the vote today. The grocery store would possibly come before the Commission after the demolition application has been filed and if the 30-day hold process is needed.

Chair Garcia asked about 13th Street being converted to non-public use as part of the proposed redevelopment plan.

Mr. Weight clarified that the Village Planning Committee had stipulated that a perpetual easement be placed on 13th Street, between Washington and Jefferson Streets, where that portion of 13th Street would be privately owned but would have public access.

Chair Garcia verified that there were no further questions from the Commission.

Chair Garcia invited the property owner or representative to share any comments.

Mr. Virgil J. Berry Jr. said his son, Virgil J. Berry III, was also attending with him. He clarified that his father, Virgil J. Berry Sr. arrived in Phoenix in 1949, and he believes that his family *is* the historic significance of the property. The house/real estate office was the place in the Eastlake neighborhood where people would come to notarize documents or get advice. Some of the prominent visitors to the house were Calvin Goode, Cloves Campbell, and William Dickey. The office also served as headquarters to former City Council members Cody Williams and Michael Johnson. The building has historical significance, and it is especially significant to the African American community of Eastlake. He

shared that the goal was to convert the public space, by the historic house and behind the proposed hotel, to a private space dedicated to the Eastlake neighborhood to commemorate its history. He is pleased that the proposed plans focus on preserving the historic building, providing housing for the neighborhood, and providing job opportunities with the addition of the hotel. He believes that this a project for the betterment of Phoenix and the Eastlake community. He said that he would appreciate the Commission's support of this project.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any questions or comments for Mr. Berry. No questions were posed by the Commission.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Berry for attending and sharing his comments with the Commission.

Chair Garcia then referenced a request for public comment from Donna Reiner.

Ms. Reiner said that she had done research on Nello B. Greenlee and the subject property as part of an article that was previously published in the Arizona Republic. She said that Dr. Greenlee was quite interesting, and the house was amazing. She was surprised to discover that the subject property was not previously surveyed, nor was it included in the original survey of African American historic properties. She mentioned that when the house was constructed in 1926, it was valued at $10,000, which was an enormous value in the mid-1920s. Dr. Greenlee was also the Post Commander for the African American Legion Post. She also mentioned that she had done some research on Wade Hammond and discovered that Mr. Hammond had started the first band program at Carver High School. She said that she was fully supportive of the HP overlay zoning on this property.

Chair Garcia verified that there were no further public comments. He then asked the Commission for any further discussion or comments on this item.

Vice Chair Amato expressed her appreciation for Mr. Berry bringing this project to the HP Commission. She thinks that this is a great project, which will bring needed economic opportunities to Eastlake Park. She agrees that the historic house being preserved is important to the African American heritage in the City of Phoenix. She then spoke as a real estate professional and referenced the historical limitations for African Americans to purchase and sell properties in specified areas within the city. She sees the preservation of the subject property as a great monument to many important African American entrepreneurs in the City of Phoenix.

Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

	Commissioner Varvel Hartsell made a motion to approve the recommendation for an HP overlay on the subject property at 1321 East Washington Street. Vice Chair Amato seconded the motion. The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes Approved 6 – 0.	
5.	Phoenix Laundry and Dry Cleaning (Milum Textile Services) at 333 N 7th Ave Action Requested: Information and possible initiation of HP overlay zoning Chair Garcia invited Helana Ruter to present this item. Ms. Ruter said that on October 31, 2023, the HP Office had received a demolition application for the Phoenix Laundry and Dry Cleaning (Milum Textile Services) property located at 333 North 7th Street. She gave some background information, as follows: • A.H. & G.H. Lawrence founded Phoenix Laundry & Dry Cleaning Co in 1893 and constructed a plant on this site in 1924 • Major fire in 1935 – reconstruction & new construction on site including new wood lamella roofs in two buildings • Boyd Milum purchased Phoenix Laundry & Dry Cleaning Co in 1956 and founded Milum Textile Services • Milum operated until 2020 under President/owner Craig Milum Ms. Ruter displayed aerial photos of the site and exterior/interior photos of the structures, which show the Streamline Moderne facades as well as the two interior lamella roof components. She said that the City of Phoenix HP Office worked with the Community and Economic Development Department (CEDD) to identify the most valuable portions of the property for long-term preservation that could allow for new development on the property. The areas of the subject property that were identified by the HP Office as most significant include the 7th Avenue façade and the 3000-sf lamella roof as well as the 10,000-sf lamella roof fronting 6th Avenue. Next, Ms. Ruter shared that the owners intend to subdivide the subject property into northern and southern portions and sell the southern portion, as depicted on the parcel map displayed. This would require a	**Helana Ruter, HP Staff**

more immediate demolition of the standalone building, fronting 7th Avenue, at the south as well as a portion of the 6th Avenue facing structures, which had previously been determined by the HP Office as less worthy of preservation and eligible for release.

Ms. Ruter stated that the property, overall, has been recommended as eligible for listing in the Phoenix Historic Property Register under Criteria A and C, as follows:

- Criterion A for its association with commerce in Phoenix and early commercial growth outside of the downtown area; and
- Criterion C for its streamline moderne architecture as well as the two wide-span Lamella roof structures

In conclusion, Ms. Ruter stated that the current 30-day demolition hold will conclude on November 30, 2023.

Chair Garcia invited the property owners, Craig and Marilyn Milum, to address the HP Commission, or if they would prefer, they could comment after the Commission discussion and public comments. Mr. and Mrs. Milum preferred to wait until after public comment.

Next, Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions for Ms. Ruter on her presentation.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell asked for clarification on whether the HP overlay would cover only the structures highlighted in blue on the aerial photo, or the entire property.

Ms. Ruter said that it is the purview of the HP Commission to determine the boundary for the HP overlay.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell asked whether the property owners had a preference on where to place the boundary for an HP overlay on the property.

Chair Garcia asked the property owners if they would like to respond and invited them up to the podium for their comments.

Mrs. Milum responded that they had originally requested demolition of the structures on the southern portion since those were determined as releasable due to no significant value. She said that they have not been able to sell the property, because no developers are interested in taking on the structure that fronts 7th Avenue and the two lamella ceilings. She said that they have worked with the City of Phoenix for almost four years to determine an alternate use of the property. They are done spending their time and still not finding a viable solution. They now want to demolish the entire property and move on to retirement. Mrs. Milum said that the property's lamella ceilings are deteriorating and are not in good condition. She does not think the public would be served by keeping the lamella ceilings intact at the subject property. She referenced the lamella ceilings at the State Fairgrounds and said that would be a better place

for the public to view that type of ceilings. She said that a developer had backed out due to the high costs, even with city incentives, to preserve the ceilings within redevelopment of the site.

Mr. Milum said that the ceilings on site have deteriorated from continuous exposure to steam inside the commercial laundry over many years.

Mrs. Milum stated that the property is vacant, but they are still paying the property taxes and for the utilities. They have had challenges trying to keep the property insured.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. and Mrs. Milum for their comments and said that they would be invited to speak again after the public comments.

Vice Chair Amato asked how long ago the property owners had started working with the City of Phoenix.

Mrs. Milum responded that they began working with Christine Mackay, Director of Community & Economic Development, four years ago.

Chair Garcia verified that there were no further questions from the Commission. He then said he received several requests for public comment on this item, and invited the follow for comment:

Ashley Harder: Ms. Harder spoke on behalf of Preserve Phoenix and expressed its appreciation for the architecture of the subject property. They think this property is a good example of industrial commercial property type. They closely follow cases for redevelopment in the Roosevelt Historic District, and they were aware of the case by previous developer. They support adaptive reuse of the site and support an HP overlay over the entire property.

Brian Cassidy: Mr. Cassidy said that he is the Managing Partner at CCBG Architecture firm located in the warehouse district in downtown Phoenix. His firm has experience with adaptive reuse projects. The firm was working with the previous developer, which over the past two years, was under an option to purchase the property from The Milums. That option was severed in August 2023, and his firm had since stopped working on the project. His firm had proposed a 7-story multifamily housing project. They also proposed to save both the lamella ceilings, the 7th Avenue façade structure, and part of the sign. After the business relationship was severed with the previous developer, a new developer had approached his firm to take a different look at the site. His firm was commissioned to conduct a yield study for a high-rise, which would limit development to the southern portion of the site. He said that both of the concepts by his firm were viable adaptive reuse options for the site.

Donna Reiner: Ms. Reiner agreed with Mr. Cassidy's comments about the flexibility of adaptive reuse to incorporate the historic components in the redevelopment of the site. She also agreed that the property has

some baggage. However, she said it was important to remember the overall relevance of the history of the subject property to the history of the City of Phoenix. If the property was demolished, how would anyone know what a significant business Milum Textiles was and what a significant property it was.

GG George: Ms. George spoke on behalf of the Phoenix Historic Neighborhoods Coalition and referenced the letter it provided to the Commission. She said that lamella roofs are an endangered species in Arizona. The State Fairgrounds has the only other lamella roof structures in the City of Phoenix. The Coalition believes the lamella roofs on the Milum building should be saved and deserve consideration. The Coalition requests that the HP Commission initiate an HP overlay on the property to allow more time for the community to find a business that could save the building and its unique roof structures.

Beatrice Moore: Ms. Moore had the opportunity to tour the Milum buildings as part of a previous Grand Avenue Festival. She understands that older buildings might have problems, but she thinks the Milum buildings are spectacular. She then referenced the successful adaptive reuse project for the Bragg's Pie property. She encouraged the Commission to put the HP overlay on the two highlighted buildings in the northern portion of the property. She would also like to see the history of the Milum business be preserved and promoted.

Robert Warnecke: Mr. Warnecke thanked the HP Office for the staff report on the Milum Textile Services building. He thinks it is important to preserve the historic structures on site. He urged the property owners to come to an agreement with the Commission to place the HP overly on the northern portion of the property and agree to not place the HP overlay on the southern portion. He thinks this would allow for preservation of the historic element on the north structures and allow for the owners to move forward with selling the southern portion of the property.

Kim Kasper: Ms. Kasper said that she was not representing any organization, she wanted to share her personal comments. She said that there is great responsibility with owning historic properties. She owns a historic property and is well aware of the responsibilities that come with ownership. She said that she also toured the Milum buildings at previous Grand Avenue Festivals, and said the buildings were well-maintained while the business existed. She referenced the property owners' comments that the buildings have deteriorated, and she expressed concerns about a possible demolition by neglect and just leaving a vacant lot on the property. She lives a couple blocks away from the subject property, and she also expressed her concerns over possible environmental issues on the site.

Chair Garcia mentioned that Commissioner Klocke needed to leave the meeting, but he wanted to state that he was in full support of initiating the HP overlay zoning on the buildings that staff recommended. Also,

Commissioner Klocke did have a question for the property owners. He asked whether there was a full and documented clean environmental report on the subject property. A developer may choose not to purchase the property without such documentation.

Mrs. Milum said that they have a letter from the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) that states no further action.

Chair Garcia verified there were no further requests for public comment, and he then invited the property owners to share any additional comments at this time.

Mrs. Milum said that they have been good stewards of the property. They have been working with the city for the past four years and waiting on finding a developer to purchase the property and incorporate the historic structures into a redevelopment plan. Over the last four years, it has become a burden for them to maintain the property, and they are tired of waiting to sell it. She said that if so many others want to save the property, she suggested that they could get together and purchase the property from them so that they could move on with their lives.

Mr. Milum said that the property was heavily marketed and multiple listings. He said that multiple commercial real estate professionals had visited the property and it was well known within the commercial real estate industry.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. and Mrs. Milum for their closing comments. He then asked the Commission for any further comments.

Commissioner Thomson asked for a status on the current condition of the lamella roofs.

Ms. Ruter said that she visited the site and found the lamella roofs in general to be in good condition overall.

Commissioner Thomson then asked whether the historic sign and facades could be preserved as an option.

Mr. Weight said that the HP Commission has a range of choices for the HP overlay zoning boundary. However, he said that if the Commission were to proceed with initiation, HP staff recommends placing the HP overlay, at the very minimum, on the buildings highlighted in blue, as previously displayed on the aerial photo.

Commissioner Rayle asked if any structural stability evaluations been done recently to determine whether those highlighted structures would be able to withstand the proposed demolition of the adjoining buildings.

Ms. Ruter referenced Mr. Cassidy's comments that a couple of site evaluations had been conducted by his firm. She reiterated that she had

also visited the site and said that there are several additional interior walls supporting the lamella roof structure.

Chair Garcia referenced the lamella roofs, and he understands this is a unique type of roof structure. Other than the two lamella roofs at the Milum buildings and the one at the State Fairgrounds, he is not aware of any other existing lamella roofs in the city or the state. He also pointed to the fact that the Milum building is private property, and the State Fairgrounds is open to the public. Although he thinks preserving the historic facades and sign of the Milum buildings would be a benefit to the general public, he was not sure how the public would benefit from preserving the interior roof structures of those buildings. However, he referenced public comment on the importance of preserving the history of Phoenix. He said that these tangible components of Phoenix's history could potentially be lost if the buildings were demolished.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any additional comments.

Vice Chair Amato asked for clarification whether the 3,000-sf lamella roof was separate from or integrated into the structure fronting 7th Avenue.

Ms. Ruter responded, yes, the 7th Avenue entryway structure was integrated into the smaller lamella roof structure.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell asked whether the property owners would be open to placing the HP overlay on the northern portion only and not on the southern portion of the property. So that they could move forward with selling the southern portion of the property.

Mrs. Milum said that they have an interested party, who wants to purchase the southern portion of the property. Regarding the northern portion of the property, they would be open to work with the city to preserve the façade and sign.

Commissioner Thomson reiterated her previous question about separating the parcels and HP overlay on the facades and sign.

Mr. Weight clarified his earlier response and reiterated that the Commission has a range of options for the HP overlay, such as:

- Placing it on the entire site
- Compromise of placing it only on the northern portion of site

However, it would not be advisable to place the HP overlay on only façades and signage since that would not retain sufficient historic integrity of the site for either the National or Phoenix Registers.

Chair Garcia asked the property owners to confirm that they wanted to move forward with the selling the southern portion of the site to an interested party. He also asked the owners to confirm that they would be willing to wait a bit longer to find a compromise for the norther portion of the property.

Mrs. Milum responded, yes, they want to demolish the parcels on the southern portion so that they can sell that part of the property. And yes, they are willing to wait a year on the northern portion of the property.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any other final comments.

Commissioner Rayle asked for clarification about protecting the other buildings on the site that are adjoining the structures that would be demolished.

Ms. Ruter stated that in the case of partial demolitions, the City of Phoenix does require applicants to provide a shoring and bracing plan to indicate how the existing structures would remain structurally sound.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell suggested that it would be helpful to identify the specific parcels being considered for possible HP overlay zoning.

Chair Garcia referenced the northern parcel numbers for consideration, as follows:

- APN:111-41-024C
- APN:111-41-028
- APN:111-41-029

Mr. Li thanked Chair Garcia for clarifying the parcel numbers to avoid any ambiguity with the northern portion.

Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

Commissioner Thomson made a motion to initiate an HP overlay on the three parcels identified as (APN:111-41-024C, APN:111-41-028, and APN:111-41-029) located on the northern portion of the subject property at 333 North Seventh Avenue, known as the Phoenix Laundry and Dry Cleaning (Milum Textile Services).

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell seconded the motion.

The Commission voted, as follows:
Chair Garcia – Yes
Vice Chair Amato – No
Commissioner Rayle – Yes
Commissioner Thomson – Yes
Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes

Approved 4 – 1.

(Note: Commissioner Klocke needed to leave prior to the vote for this item.)

	Chair Garcia reiterated that the Commission has just voted to initiate HP overlay on the north parcels as specified in the motion. He asked staff to clarify next steps for this case and opportunities for the property owners to address today's action by the Commission. Mr. Weight said that the case would move forward on two separate tracks. The first would be to file an application for HP overlay on the north portion of the site per the HP Commission's action. He said that the HP zoning case would be brought back before the HP Commission for a public hearing at a future date. He said that there would also be another hearing within the next 20 days, where the applicant could make a claim of economic hardship. And if that claim was successful, then the applicant would not be required to wait the full year to proceed with demolition before the one-year expires. The applicant could also make a claim that the property is not actually historically eligible. He said that both of those arguments would be heard by a Historic Preservation hearing officer. If the hearing officer's decision were to be appealed, then that appeal would be heard by the HP Commission. He said that staff would be contacting the property owners tomorrow about scheduling the next hearing. He addressed the Milums directly and said that there is a long list of items that they would need to submit for an economic hardship hearing. He said that staff is aware that it often takes longer than 20 days for applicants to gather the required information, and staff could recommend the hearing be continued if they needed more time to prepare. Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Weight for the clarification, and then moved on to the next agenda item.	
6.	William O. Sweek Residence at 2930 N 7th St (382 E Verde Ln) Action Requested: Information and possible initiation of HP overlay zoning Ms. Ruter said that this property came to the HP Office through the 30-day hold demolition application process. HP staff sent out the community notification email last week. She spoke with the property owners to inform them of some concerns from the community and that this demolition request would go before the HP Commission. Due to the narrow timeframe between submitting the demolition application and bring the case before the HP Commission, the property owners had requested more time to investigate and better understand the 30-day hold process and their possible options. She informed the Commission that the property owner had just submitted a letter via email today to formally withdraw their request for HP overlay zoning. They may resubmit at a future date. Ms. Ruter confirmed that the demolition application is now officially withdrawn and has since been deleted from the permitting system.	**Helana Ruter, HP Staff**

	Chair Garcia asked Mr. Li for clarification whether the Commission needed to vote or discuss this item, or whether it was appropriate to not discuss at this time and move on to the next item. Paul Li confirmed that since the property owner had submitted an official notice of withdrawal, then no discussion or vote would be required for this item. Chair Garcia moved forward to the next item.	
7.	Phil Gordon Threatened Building Grant request for Seargeant-Oldaker Residence (649 N 3rd Ave) Action Requested: Recommendation on grant funding Chair Garcia invited Helana Ruter to present this item. Ms. Ruter reiterated that back in September, the HP Commission had authorized the City of Phoenix to apply for a Heritage Grant for the Seargeant-Oldaker Residence. She said that the HP Office had intended to use Warehouse and Threatened Building Grant funds as a match to the Heritage Grant funds, and that is the intention of this agenda item. Ms. Ruter stated that the subject property is listed in both the Phoenix and National Registers, under: • Criterion B for the association with a prominent Phoenician, Elizabeth Seargeant-Oldaker • Criterion C as an example of Craftsman-style bungalow Ms. Ruter said that the request is for $400,000 of Phil Gordon Threatened Building Grant (PGTBG) funds. The developer is requesting to relocate the building to the northwest corner of the subject property to facilitate adaptive reuse of the building as commercial restaurant space to be incorporated into a broader redevelopment plan for the entire site. As part of this effort, the city applied for an Arizona Historic Preservation Heritage Fund grant in the amount of $324,329 with a required 40% match of $216,220. The city also prepared a revised National Register of Historic Place Nomination to reflect the proposed move, as relocation requires a specific evaluation in terms of continued National Register eligibility. This nomination passed the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee and will be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for final evaluation. The Heritage Fund grant-eligible work items are similar to those established under the Threatened Buildings Grant Funds and vary slightly with the inclusion of historic interior material refinishing. However, the Heritage funds cannot be used towards the actual relocation efforts. In addition to providing funds towards the 40% State Heritage Fund match, the proposed threatened building funds would also be used towards the relocation efforts of the subject building. In conclusion, Ms. Ruter said that staff was recommending approval of up to $400,000 Phil Gordon Threatened Building Grant funds. A dollar-	**Helana Ruter, HP Staff**

for-dollar match would be required. The funds would be disbursed on a reimbursement basis. In exchange for the grant funding, a 30-year conservation easement would be recorded on the title.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments on this item.

Vice Chair Amato asked if it had been determined whether the building would still retain historic eligibility after it is moved.

Ms. Ruter stated that the updated nomination was reviewed by the Historic Sites Review Committee (HSRC) on November 3, 2023. The HSRC approved to forward the updated nomination to be forwarded to the Keeper of the National Register for final determination. The Phoenix HP Office is optimistically awaiting a response. She said that it was not unprecedented for buildings to have been moved and still retain eligibility, especially individually eligible for architecture that is still visibly present.

Chair Garcia had received a few requests for public comment. He invited the following to share their comments.

Donna Reiner: She had already left the meeting.

Kim Kasper: She has been following the case for the Seargeant-Oldaker House in an effort to stand up for her neighborhood. She has not always agreed with previous discussions at past meetings. However, she is happy with the new plan, and she has faith that the developer will honor the plans for the Seargeant-Oldaker House.

Ben Patton: He is a member of the development team, and they are grateful for the opportunity to preserve and activate this house. His firm is a boutique urban housing developer with a core business of multifamily housing. This project requires great effort, but this opportunity is too great to pass up. He said his firm would be very grateful for the approval of the full amount requested to help defray the considerable costs of this project.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Patton for taking the opportunity to attend the meeting and represent the development team.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any further discussion on this item. No additional questions or comments were posed.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

Vice Chair Amato made a motion to approve up to $400,000 of grant funds for the Seargeant Oldaker Residence at 649 North Third Avenue, as part of the Phil Gordon Threatened Building Grant Program.

Commissioner Thomson seconded the motion.

	The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes Approved 5 – 0.	
8.	Schedule for PreservePhx 2025 plan update Action Requested: Recommendation on plan update schedule Ms. Ruter said that the HP Commission and Staff are still working through dual efforts regarding the PlaceEconomics Preservation Toolkit as the underpinning of moving forward with updating the Historic Preservation Plan, which was originally created in 2015. The HP Office is anticipating that the updated plan would be adopted in 2025. Ms. Ruter thanked Commissioner Thomson for graciously offering the Carver Museum as the venue for the kickoff meeting on October 14, 2023. She mentioned that she was still looking to HP Commissioners to provide their feedback on the PlaceEconomic Preservation Toolkit and to highlight the top six areas for the HP Office to focus on at community outreach meetings and associated surveys. Then Ms. Ruter reviewed the draft timeline for the development and adoption of the PreservePHX 2025 plan update, as follows: • 10/14/2023: Initial Kickoff as part of PlanPHX update 2025 • Dec 2023 – Feb 2024: Stakeholder engagement; survey/public meetings • Mar – Apr 2024: Recap of public engagement; Consult with other city departments/government agencies • May – Jul 2024: Write draft *PreserveHistoricPHX Plan* update • Aug 2024: Circulate draft update internally • Sep 2024: Draft to HP Commission (HPC) • Oct 2024: Draft to Village Planning Committees (VPC) • Nov 2024: Prepare final draft *PreserveHistoricPHX Plan 2025* • Dec 2024: Present to HPC • Jan 2025: Present to VPCs • Feb 2025: Present to Planning Commission • Mar 2025: Present to Council Subcommittee • Apr 2025: Present to Council Formal for adoption Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any questions or comments on this item. None were posed. Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.	**Helana Ruter, HP Staff**

	Commissioner Varvel Hartsell made a motion to adopt the schedule as proposed by staff for the PreservePHX 2025 plan update. Vice Chair Amato seconded the motion. The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes Approved 5 – 0.	
9.	**Update on requests for demolition** • 30-day demolition holds • Properties on the Phoenix Register **Action Requested:** Information and possible discussion Chair Garcia invited Emma Collins to present the updates. Ms. Collins referenced the 30-day hold report that was provided to the HP Commission and briefly reviewed the DAPPs that were submitted since last meeting, as follows: DAPPs (11 Total) o (9) Open o (1) Closed o (1) Withdrawn HPDEs Approved (1) - Previously approved via HPDE 2200334 for demolition of a non-historic structure. Chair Garcia asked for clarification about the two demolition applications for 10919 South Central Avenue. Ms. Ruter said that the two buildings are within the historically designated South Mountain Park and are currently in the 1-year stay of demolition. She also said that the Parks Department has stated that both facilities had been used as on-site housing for park rangers. However, both facilities are vacant, having not been utilized for a number of years, and there is no intended use for either building moving forward. She said that the HP Office needs to continue having internal discussions with the Parks Department about formal documentation of the two structures and possible options to mitigate that loss. Chair Garcia requested to have a representative from the Parks Department to give a presentation about these two structures at the next meeting. Ms. Ruter agreed and would invite the Parks Department to present to the HP Commission in January 2024.	**Emma Collins, HP Staff**

	Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any further questions or comments on this item. Vice Chair Amato asked for clarification on what plans were proposed for the site after those two buildings would be demolished at South Mountain Park. Ms. Ruter said it was her understanding that the Parks Department would reclaim the vacant lots as just part of the desert park area. Chair Garcia said he looks forward to the presentation from the Parks Department at next month's Commission meeting, perhaps then they can share what the specific plans are for the site. He then moved on to the next agenda item.	
10.	**Advocacy and outreach update** Chair Garcia said that Donna Reiner had submitted some advocacy items to be shared for general public comment agenda item, as follows: • Nov 30-Free webinar on Early Aviation in Arizona • Dec 12-Free Book Club Session on *The Water Knife* by Paolo Bacigalupi • Dec 14-Free Webinar on *Architecture 101: The Architecture of Arizona's Working-Class Communities* Each of these events will be presented by Arizona Preservation Foundation and the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office. Registration is required. More information and the registration links are available via the website: azpreservation.org. Commissioner Varvel Hartsell shared that the next Arizona Preservation Conference is scheduled in June 2024 and will be held in Prescott. She encouraged the Commission to register early.	**HP Commission**
11.	**Staff updates and requests for information from staff** Kevin Weight gave an update on the 2023 Exterior Rehabilitation Grant applicant round. The deadline to submit applications was last Friday, November 17, 2023, by 5:00 PM. He said that the HP Office had received 38 applications. The grant panel will convene on December 15th to review the grant applications. He mentioned that Tricia Amato, HP Commissioner, will be a panel member along with a neighborhood representative who is also a former recipient of ER grant funds, and three HP staff members. This panel will create a list of projects to recommend to the HP Commission at the January 8, 2024, meeting.	**HP Commission and Staff**
12.	**Future agenda items** The Law Department will be conducting training for boards and commissions, which includes both the HP Commission and the Heritage	**HP Commission and Staff**

	Commission. Therefore, the training will be presented at the next scheduled meeting for the Heritage Commission meeting, which will include all members of the HP Commission plus the two additional Commission members on the Heritage Commission.	
13.	**Public Comment and Communication** Julia Taggart asked the HP Commission to consider reviewing historic trails, parks and preserves. She thinks it would be a good way to educate the general public and younger generations of the history behind the names of the trails, parks, and preserves and to keep those histories alive into future generations. Marilyn Riggs said that she enjoyed listening to the meeting and found it to be interesting and very informative. Chair Garcia noted the passing of Former Phoenix Mayor Thelda Williams. He mentioned that then-Mayor Williams had appointed him to the HP Commission. He expressed his appreciation for her long-time public service to the City of Phoenix and her many years of advocacy for historic preservation.	**Public**
14.	**Adjournment** Chair Garcia adjourned the meeting at 6:57 p.m.	**HP Commission**

For further information, please call the Historic Preservation Office at 602-261-8699.

For reasonable accommodations, call Elaine Noble at Voice 602-495-0256 or the City TTY Relay (602) 534-5500 as early as possible to coordinate needed arrangements.

Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar lo más pronto posible a la Oficina de Preservación Histórica de la ciudad de Phoenix al 602-261-8699.