

175814

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING OF THE
PHOENIX HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Meeting
Final Minutes**

Date: September 18, 2023
Time: 4:30 p.m.
Location: Hybrid Meeting: In-person at City Council Chambers & Virtual via Webex

Commission Members Present	Staff Present
Dan Garcia, Chair	Helana Ruter
Tricia Amato, Vice Chair	Desiree Aranda
Dan Klocke	Cletus Montoya
Taz Khatri	Emma Collins
Christina Noble (<i>virtual</i>)	Bridget Collins
Greta Rayle (<i>virtual</i>)	Jodey Elsner (<i>virtual</i>)
Brenda Thomson (<i>virtual</i>)	Crystal Carrancho (<i>virtual</i>)
Keely Varvel Hartsell	Paul Li
Commission Members Absent	Staff Absent
	Kevin Weight

1.	Call meeting to order Chair Garcia verified that a quorum was established and called the meeting to order at 4:35 p.m.	Dan Garcia, HP Commission Chair
2.	Introduction of Commission Members and Staff The Commission members and HP staff made their introductions.	HP Commission & Staff
3.	Review of meeting minutes from the annual work session and the monthly meeting held on August 21, 2023. Action Requested: Approval of minutes – two separate actions Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments about the draft minutes from the August 21 st annual work session. Vice Chair Amato requested an edit to verbiage for agenda item three of the work session minutes. Staff stated edit would be made on the finalized minutes. Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on the minutes from the August 21 st annual work session. Vice Chair Amato made a motion to approve the minutes with requested edit for the August 21, 2023, annual work session. Commissioner Varvel Hartsell seconded the motion.	HP Commission

	<p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Nobel – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 8 – 0.</p> <p>Next, Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments on the draft minutes from the August 21st monthly meeting.</p> <p>Chair Garcia referenced his comments on page five regarding the easement on the Hotel San Carlos. He clarified that he was asking a question rather than stating a suggestion. Staff said that the edit would be made on the finalized minutes.</p> <p>Then Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on the minutes from the August 21st monthly meeting.</p> <p>Commissioner Varvel Hartsell made a motion to approve the minutes with requested edit for the August 21, 2023, monthly meeting.</p> <p>Commissioner Khatri seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Nobel – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 8 – 0.</p>	
4.	<p>Initiation of HP overlay zoning for the Yaun Ah Gim Grocery, 1002 S. 4th Ave.</p> <p>Action Requested: Initiation of HP overlay zoning Chair Garcia invited Helana Ruter to present this item.</p> <p>Ms. Ruter said that the HP Office received a request for designation of the Yaun Ah Gim Grocery located at 1002 South 4th Avenue. She said that the buyer under contract submitted the request for designation, and the current property owner was amenable to the designation.</p>	Helana Ruter, HP Staff

Then Ms. Ruter displayed street-view photos of the subject property. The grocery store is located at the southwest corner of 4th Avenue and Tonto Street. A duplex is immediately adjacent to the south and a separate four-plex is located to the west on the lot. The duplex is missing its roof and is in a seriously deteriorated condition. She said that the proposed new owner was planning to turn the site into a multi-family dwelling. There is a significant amount of work needed to rehabilitate these buildings. The proposed new owner intends to apply for Threatened Building grant funds for the rehabilitation of the buildings, which would necessitate designation of the property. She said that the request for initiation of the HP overlay zoning would be the first step in the process.

Chair Garcia then invited Omar Fabian, the soon-to-be property owner, to share his comments. Mr. Fabian did not wish to speak.

Chair Garcia then invited Sherry Rampy to share her comments.

Ms. Rampy said that she is representing both the sellers and the buyer in the sale of the subject property. She was invited by Mr. Fabian to speak on his behalf. First, she mentioned that the current owners had intended to restore the property and had previously begun working on it. However, life circumstances had shifted their focus to prioritizing family over continuing working on the restoration. The owners have decided to sell the property so that it could be restored by a new owner rather than fall into further disrepair if they held onto the property. She was happy that Mr. Fabian is the proposed buyer of the property. She mentioned that Mr. Fabian is a native Phoenician, and he is a counselor for the Roosevelt School District. She and Mr. Fabian had a meeting with HP staff, Ms. Ruter and Mr. Weight to discuss his intentions for the subject property. Mr. Fabian said he felt bad that there were so many properties in south Phoenix that had fallen into disrepair. He wants to help revitalize the area starting with rehabilitating the subject property. It is his intention to rehabilitate the duplex and four-plex to be utilized as multifamily residences for affordable housing. He also wants to rehabilitate the historic market to be utilized as a community space on the site. Mr. Fabian wants to begin with obtaining HP overlay zoning on the property so that he can stabilize the buildings on the site.

Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any questions or comments on this item.

Commissioner Khatri asked for clarification on how the grocery portion of the structure would be utilized. She asked whether it would have a multifamily residential use.

Ms. Rampy responded there was a possibility that the market would be converted to additional units. It was also possible for it to be utilized as a community space or even a bodega since there are no grocery stores in that area, which has been classified as a food desert. She expressed her support for the HP overlay zoning, and she believes the

rehabilitation of this site would have a positive impact on the neighborhood and the City of Phoenix.

Chair Garcia thanked Ms. Rampy for presenting. He thinks this is a wonderful opportunity to reclaim what appears to be a promising property with historical significance. He thanked Ms. Rampy and Mr. Fabian for bringing this request to the HP Commission.

Vice Chair Amato stated that she was the agent who previously sold the property to the existing owners. She is happy that a new potential buyer has been found and that they want to protect this property. She said that neighborhood has such potential, and she believes that the subject property could become the anchor needed to revitalize the neighborhood. She also stated that she has a financial agreement with Ms. Rampy, therefore she would be recusing herself from voting on this item.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell referenced the National Register Nomination form, which nominated the subject property as part of the Phoenix Commercial Multiple Resources Area. She asked whether there would be any restrictions for this property to be utilized as multi-housing in the future.

Ms. Ruter responded that the Historic Preservation designation of a property does not impact its usage. She said that the underlying zoning would not be altered with the HP overlay.

Chair Garcia asked for clarification that the attached nomination form was the existing National Register Nomination, and that this current request for designation was for the Phoenix Register of Historic Properties.

Ms. Ruter responded, that was correct. She mentioned that the attached National Nomination form was an outdated format where SHPO would select a theme and then nominate individual properties that were reflective of the theme. She stated that the subject property was listed to the National Register under the commercial property theme.

Commissioner Khatri mentioned that there would need to be significant changes to the market building (i.e. – windows and doors) for it to be used as a multifamily residence. She shared this information for the Commission's consideration.

Chair Garcia verified that there were no further questions or comments from the Commission.

Then Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

Commissioner Khatri made a motion to approve the initiation of HP overlay zoning for the Yaun Ah Gim Grocery located at 1002 South 4th Avenue.

	<p>Commissioner Thomson seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Recused Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Nobel – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 7 – 0, with 1 Recusal.</p>	
5.	<p>Public Hearing for Application No. Z-38-23-6, Walter Hubbard Sterling Residence at 7519 N. 9th Pl.</p> <p>Action Requested: Recommendation on Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay Zoning</p> <p>Chair Garcia invited Desiree Aranda to present this item.</p> <p>Ms. Aranda said this was a request to establish HP overlay zoning on the Walter Hubbard Sterling Residence located at 7519 North 9th Place. She said that HP staff was recommending approval of this rezoning request. She then shared some background about the subject property, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property owner: Humphrey Family Trust (Erik & Katie Humphrey, Trustees) • AUG 2022: Owners contacted HP Office to request HP designation on the Phoenix Historic Properties Register • HP Staff determined subject property appeared eligible • JAN 2023: North Wind Resource Consulting completed inventory form; Verified property was eligible for historic designation • MAR 4, 2023: Property owners signed Ownership Authorization Form and Proposition 207 Waiver allowing the HP Commission to initiate HP overlay zoning on their behalf • MAR 20, 2023: HP Commission formally initiated HP overlay zoning • JUL 11, 2023: Zoning Case Z-38-23-6 was filed by HP Staff <p>Ms. Aranda displayed aerial photos of the subject property located in Camelback East neighborhood with major cross streets of 7th Street and Orangewood Avenue. The aerial also showed an overview of the entire property, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 30,501 sq. ft. lot • L-shaped, 2-story main house • 1-story guest house <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ Connected to main house by covered patio (1948) • Swimming pool (1948) • Tennis court (1958-1959) 	<p>Desiree Aranda, HP Staff</p>

- Attached carport (1998-1999)
- Pergola (1999-2001)

Some additional photos showed the primary facades as well as rear yard, which included the original pool and non-original tennis courts. Other photos showed views of the main house from the guest house and a night view of the house and pool.

Next, Ms. Aranda referenced a 1956 article published in the Arizona Republic that noted the house's progressive design included:

- Ground floor with a *welcome entry* and gallery of hydraulically operated window walls opening to an outdoor patio
- Dining area includes a bar and *St. Charles* kitchen
- *Children's wing* includes 4 bedrooms, each with adjoining bathrooms
- Separate laundry and *servant's apartment*
- Second floor reserved for adults, includes:
 - Huge living room
 - Bar
 - Balconies
 - Master suite includes 2 dressing rooms and a bathroom
- Entire house cooled by refrigeration and equipped with intercom system

Ms. Aranda briefly shared some history of the Sterling Family. She also gave a quick review of the eligibility criteria: age, significance, and Integrity. Then she reviewed the evaluation of the Sterling Residence, as follows:

- Meets age requirement (75 years old)
- Meets significance requirement under Criterion C:
 - Good, early example of Contemporary-style residential architecture constructed in Phoenix after World War II
 - Designed by Sam Bell, a friend of Sterling Family and fellow member of Phoenix's postwar social scene
 - Elements include:
 - Flat roof with broad overhanging eaves
 - Large window walls
 - Natural building materials (wood and stone)
- Meets integrity requirement (tennis court, carport, and pergola added later), otherwise unchanged

The boundary for the HP overlay is proposed as follows:

- 0.75 gross acres;
- Includes entire subject parcel as well as the adjacent portion of the right of way;
- Contains the documented historic resources;
- Follows parcel lines and street monument lines as much as possible

In conclusion, Ms. Aranda said HP staff was recommending approval of the HP overlay zoning for the Walter Hubbard Sterling Residence.

	<p>Chair Garcia thanked Ms. Aranda for her presentation. He then asked whether the property owner or representative wished to comment. None were present.</p> <p>Next, Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments on this item.</p> <p>Commissioner Khatri asked whether the whole site, including all buildings, was included in the request for designation.</p> <p>Ms. Aranda reiterated that the proposed overlay boundary includes the entire subject parcel and contains the documented historic resources.</p> <p>Ms. Ruter concurred with Ms. Aranda. She also said that over time things could be modified without risking the status of the property.</p> <p>Commissioner Khatri also asked for clarification whether landscaping would be included in the designation.</p> <p>Ms. Ruter responded, correct, landscaping would not be included.</p> <p>Commissioner Rayle said that since she had co-authored the property survey inventory form for the subject property, she was recusing herself from the vote on this item.</p> <p>Then Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.</p> <p>Vice Chair Amato made a motion to approve Application Z-38-23-6 for the Walter Hubbard Sterling Residence located at 7519 North 9th Place.</p> <p>Commissioner Khatri seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Nobel – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Recused Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 7 – 0, with 1 Recusal.</p>	
6.	<p>CLG Review of the National Register Nomination Amendment for the Elizabeth Seargeant-Emery Oldaker House located at 649 N. 3rd Ave.</p> <p>Action Requested: Recommendation to the Historic Sites Review Committee</p>	<p>Helana Ruter, HP Staff</p>

Chair Garcia invited Ms. Ruter to present this item.

Ms. Ruter mentioned that the property owner had recently met with staff at the city of Phoenix HP Office and SHPO to discuss the possibility of applying for Heritage Fund grants or Park Services tax credits. As part of that discussion, SHPO stated that in order to be eligible for funding, the subject property must maintain its designation status on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). There was a concern that the proposed move of the subject building on site could potentially jeopardize its NRHP status. An amendment to the designation was created and it proposes that the subject property would maintain its designation with a move.

Ms. Ruter referenced the copy of the amendment that was provided to the HP Commission members. She stated that the HP Commission is required to review the nomination per the Phoenix Certified Local Government (CLG) Agreement. The HP Commission is required to make a recommendation to the Historic Sites Review Committee (HSRC) regarding the following:

- a) Whether the subject property is eligible for the National Register;
- b) Whether the documentation is accurate; and
- c) Whether the documentation is complete

The HSRC will review this nomination at its next meeting on November 3, 2023.

Ms. Ruter gave some background information about the Elizabeth Seargeant-Emory Oldaker House, as follows:

- Individually listed in the NRHP under Roosevelt Neighborhood Multiple Resource Area nomination in 1983
- Eligible under Criterion B for its association with prominent Phoenician Elizabeth Seargeant-Oldaker
- Eligible under Criterion C as an excellent example of Craftsman Bungalow architecture in Phoenix
- House is situated on subject property comprised of three lots

Ms. Ruter mentioned that the property owner proposes to relocate the house to the northwest corner of the subject property, roughly 12 feet to the west and 25 feet to the north in order to retain and adaptively reuse, the historic dwelling to accommodate additional development on the site. She stated that the amendment requests consideration of the relocation on the existing parcel as meeting Criterion Consideration B (moved properties).

In conclusion, Ms. Ruter shared staff's recommendation that the HP Commission recommend that the NRHP nomination amendment be forwarded to the HSRC for approval.

Chair Garcia asked for clarification on what distance would be classified as a move.

Ms. Ruter said that she did not find any guideline specifying an established distance to qualify as a move. She said that Bill Collins and Eric Vondy of SHPO stated that moving the subject property would trigger the need to re-evaluate its designation status.

Chair Garcia said, given all the efforts to save this building, that it was an excellent compromise.

Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for questions or comments on this item.

Vice Chair Amato asked for clarification whether moving the house 25 feet to the north would land on the property line.

Ms. Ruter said it appears so. She said that the subject property is within the Downtown Code, which has more flexibility than zoning in other areas outside of downtown.

Vice Chair Amato asked whether there were plans to renovate the historic house, and would it be utilized as a single-family rental.

Ms. Ruter said that she understood the plan was to rehabilitate the historic building and activate it as a restaurant space. For heritage funding to be considered, there must be a public benefit and the building must be accessible by the public for the project to qualify for the funding.

Commissioner Klocke said that these plans are the types of adaptive solutions that the HP Commission has been looking for over the years. He expressed his gratitude to Matt Seaman, the former owner, and Ben Patton, the new owner for collaborating and finding these solutions for this property. He asked for clarification whether a demolition permit was required for moving the subject property. He said that the demolition permit needs to be very clear that the developer is not demolishing the house, they are only moving the house from its foundation instead.

Commissioner Khatri asked for clarification whether the entryway stairs would be on the property line.

Ms. Ruter said that the front entrance would face Third Avenue, which would still have a 10-ft setback. She also said that there is zero setback for the property line facing McKinely Street.

Chair Garcia referenced a public comment card submitted by Kim Kasper noting her support of this item. He asked Ms. Kasper if she wanted to make any additional comment. Ms. Kasper responded, no.

Then Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

Commissioner Klocke made a motion that the HP Commission recommend to the HSRC for approval, staff's recommendation of an amendment to the National Registration Nomination for the Elizabeth Seargeant-Emery Oldaker House located at 649 North Third Avenue.

	<p>Commissioner Varvel Hartsell seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Nobel – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 8 – 0.</p>	
7.	<p>Request to apply for Arizona Heritage Fund Grant for the Seargeant-Oldaker House located at 649 N. 3rd Ave.</p> <p>Action Requested: Recommendation on grant application</p> <p>Chair Garcia invited Ms. Ruter to present this item.</p> <p>Ms. Ruter said that the HP Office was applying for a Heritage Fund grant funding to assist with the move and rehabilitation of the Seargeant-Oldaker House. She said that grant fund applications need to be approved by City Council. As part of the grant application process, it needs to be reviewed by the HP Commission. This year, the Arizona Heritage Fund has grant funding available up to \$360,000. The grant awards would depend on the number of applications received and how many are accepted by the Heritage Fund. The first round of grant application reviews will be in November. There is a 60-40 match requirement. She said that the HP Office could also apply Threatened Building grant funds to provide the match for the Heritage funding.</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments on this item.</p> <p>Commissioner Klocke asked for clarification on the required 60-40 match for funding – who is required to provide the 60% and who is required to provide the 40%.</p> <p>Ms. Ruter responded that the applicant would need to provide at least a 40% match of the funding. That request would come before the HP Commission at a future meeting.</p> <p>Chair Garcia verified that there were no requests for public comment on this item.</p> <p>Then Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.</p>	<p>Helana Ruter, HP Staff</p>

	<p>Commissioner Varvel Hartsell made a motion to approve staff's recommendation to apply for the Arizona Heritage Fund Grant for the Sergeant-Oldaker House located at 649 North Third Avenue.</p> <p>Commissioner Khatri seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Nobel – Yes Commissioner Rayle – Yes Commissioner Thomson – Yes Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 8 – 0.</p>	
8.	<p>Update on requests for demolition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 30-day demolition holds • Properties on the Phoenix Register <p>Action Requested: Information and possible discussion</p> <p>Chair Garcia invited Emma Collins to present the updates.</p> <p>Ms. Collins referenced the 30-day hold report that was provided to the HP Commission and briefly reviewed the DAPPs that were submitted since last meeting, as follows:</p> <p>DAPPs (6 Total)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (4) Closed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ (4) Recommended not eligible • (2) Open <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ (2) To be determined <p>HPDEs Approved (None)</p> <p>HPDEs Denied (14 Total)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (5) Demolition applications denied; Currently within 1-year hold period • (8) Demolition applications denied; 1-year hold period has expired • (1) Demolition permit issued after 1-year hold period expired <p>Chair Garcia referenced two recent emails regarding new demolition applications. Ms. Collins clarified those were the two open applications noted on the DAPP report.</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments on this item. None were posed. He moved onto the next agenda item.</p>	Emma Collins, HP Staff

9.	<p>Advocacy and outreach update</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission for any advocacy or outreach updates.</p> <p>Commissioner Varvel Hartsell reiterated that the 2023 Arizona Preservation Conference is scheduled for October 25-28, 2023, and it will be held in Tucson. She said that the theme for this year's conference is History in Balance. She encouraged the HP Commissioners to attend this year. She mentioned that there are scholarships available to active Commission members to pay for their attendance on September 25th. She also mentioned that the conference committee was still requesting and accepting sponsorships.</p> <p>Chair Garcia said that he would be attending the conference. He mentioned that he would also be moderating a panel on archaeology. He encouraged anyone interested to attend the archaeology session.</p>	HP Commission
10.	<p>Staff updates and requests for information from staff</p> <p>Ms. Ruter said that Kevin Weight hosted a virtual workshop on September 14th to share information on this year's Exterior Rehabilitation (ER) grant application program. There were 15 attendees for the live online workshop. The replay video of the workshop will be uploaded to the HP web page. The deadline to submit ER grant applications is November 17, 2023.</p> <p>Ms. Ruter said that the City of Phoenix is required to adopt a new general plan every 10 years. The 2015 PlanPHX is currently being reviewed and updates are being made for the 2025 version. She also mentioned that the HP Plan was last updated in 2015. The HP Plan is concurrently being reviewed and updates will include the recommendations from the PlaceEconomics report. She also stated that the PlanPHX Summit is open to the public and is scheduled for SAT OCT 14th, 2023. She will send a follow-up email to the HP Commission as soon as the time and location are confirmed for the summit. She encouraged the HP Commission members to attend. If five or more HP Commission members would be attending, which would establish a quorum, then a public notice would be posted prior to the meeting.</p>	HP Commission and Staff
11.	<p>Future agenda items</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> AZ Preservation Conference October 25-27, 2023 <p>Ms. Ruter said that she would be attending the CLG workshop at the conference. She also mentioned that Desiree Aranda would be presenting at the conference. She invited Ms. Aranda to share about her presentations.</p> <p>Ms. Aranda said that she would be presenting as a member of Latinos and Heritage Conservation. They will be presenting a double session on Friday of the conference. Their presentation is called, <i>Latinos and</i></p>	HP Commission and Staff

	<i>Heritage Conservation: Telling Our Own Stories</i> . She encouraged those planning to attend the conference to stop by for the presentation. Next scheduled meeting: October 16, 2023	
12.	Public Comment and Communication Chair Garcia verified that there were no requests submitted for public comment and there were no comments from attendees via phone.	Public
13.	Adjournment Chair Garcia adjourned the meeting at 5:34 p.m.	HP Commission

For further information, please call the Historic Preservation Office at 602-261-8699.

For reasonable accommodations, call Elaine Noble at Voice 602-495-0256 or the City TTY Relay (602) 534-5500 as early as possible to coordinate needed arrangements.

Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar lo más pronto posible a la Oficina de Preservación Histórica de la ciudad de Phoenix al 602-261-8699.